

## INTERACTIVE CASE FOR FEBRUARY-APRIL 2007

(closed for comments)

You are the chair of the Transplant Allocation Committee for the fictitious non-profit Mellencamp foundation that coordinates the distribution of livers for transplantation for this area. Your job is to develop the criteria to be used for the allocation of livers for the current cycle. You will use your criteria to rank the three patient applications. You need to develop your criteria taking in to account medical necessity, ethics principles, including justice and fairness, and psychosocial factors. You are to weight these factors according to their importance. You are to list the patients in the order that they should receive a liver transplant and provide your reasons for placing each patient at a particular position on the list. All three patients will die, sooner or later, without a liver transplant.

I.M. Dei is a 48 year-old self-employed architect with a chronic hepatitis C virus infection (treatment resistant strain of liver disease) which he contracted in his teen years from intravenous drug use. He went through successful drug rehabilitation and stopped using drugs. He completed high school and college and has become a well-respected architect. He has had progressive liver failure for two years. In the past 6 months his condition has rapidly worsened. He is a devoted husband and father, and has been a concerned citizen of the city involved with several community projects. He has private medical insurance that will completely cover the expenses involved with liver transplant.

Elaine Valentine is a 21 year-old college student who was admitted to the hospital via the Emergency department after overdosing on acetaminophen (Tylenol) eight days ago. She became despondent after her boyfriend ended their two-year relationship. She had been having symptoms of depression for the past nine months. She was found by her roommate about 22 hours after she took a whole bottle of acetaminophen (50 tablets) and drank half a bottle of wine. She has been in the ICU for one week with progressive hepatic (liver) failure. She is medically stable, but without signs of improvement in liver function. She is not presently suicidal and wishes to live. The hepatologist (liver specialist) now characterizes her liver failure as very serious. She will need a liver transplant to survive. She has insurance that will cover 90% of the cost. Her parents are supportive and will pay the other 10%.

Sheila Murray, a former high school math teacher, is a 42 year-old mother of three children, ages nine, 11, and 14. She was diagnosed with primary biliary cirrhosis (rare form of liver disease of unknown cause) several years ago. She has been unable to work for the last few years and is presently on teachers' long term disability. Since her husband's death 18 months ago in an auto accident (he was hit head-on by a drunk driver), she has struggled to pay the bills and to feed her children. Despite compliance with her medications, her health has continued to decline. At this point, she has been referred for liver transplantation. She uses neither alcohol nor cigarettes. She has no other family. Her parents are both deceased, she has no siblings, her husband was an only child, and his parents are both deceased. Her Teacher's Medical Insurance will cover 80% of the transplant cost and she will be responsible for 20%.

Dear Students:

Thank you for your thoughtful and interesting comments. We received responses from 20 students representing four schools. Here are responses to the cases from two faculty at UT Southwestern Medical Center for you to review and discuss. We hope you have enjoyed participating in this process.

### **Professional Response #1**

**Don Rockey, M.D.**

#### **Internal Medicine-Digestive and Liver Diseases**

From a medical necessity standpoint, the patients are more similar than not, with the exception that the 21 year old overdose patient has what is termed "Fulminant Hepatic Failure" and thus, the shortest expected survival. Thus, from a medical standpoint, she would be the most urgent.

From a psychological standpoint, the 21 year old overdose patient is the least attractive. However, many patients in this situation turn out not to have psychological problems after transplantation.

From a social standpoint, the 42 year old woman with 3 children is the most problematic. In order to have a liver transplant, family or close friends must be able to care for the patient (bring the patient to the hospital; ensure that they take their medications, etc...). Thus, unless the 14 year old child is exceptionally mature and would be able to care for the mother, without other support, this patient could not be transplanted. Finances would also be an issue. Even 20% of the cost of a transplant would almost certainly overwhelm the family. In these cases, we often look to the community or church to help fund raise for the family. While "emotionally", she is the most desirable, she has the most social barriers to transplant.

Of note, the 48 year old man with hepatitis C is likely to be the most straightforward overall, and he will likely do well with the new liver, and will be compliant with his immunosuppressive medication. It is notable that there is a risk that the hepatitis C will return in the new liver. If there were only one liver to give, whether he should receive a liver at the expense of the others is a more difficult question.

### **Professional Response #2**

**Fabrice Jotterand, Ph.D.**

**Assistant Professor-Department of Psychiatry Program in Ethics in Science and Medicine**

Cases that involve patient selection are always difficult and pose challenging moral conundrums. We assume that in our society we can offer the best care available to everyone independently of the resources available or the ability to pay. After all, we live in a nation that prides itself for its advances in the biomedical sciences and the high quality of medical care. However, this case reminds us the harsh reality of contemporary medicine in United States: despite the wealth of medical resources there are cases for which hard and unfortunate choices have to be made. This case is one of many that take place every day in the clinical settings throughout the nation.

Various criteria need to be taken into account in our analysis: urgency/medical necessity, the ethical principles of justice and beneficence, ability to pay, and psychosocial factors. The first step then is to rank these criteria in order of importance and relevance to the case at hand. I will start with the criteria that are the least relevant to our case, that is, the ability to pay and the ethical principle of justice.

One might be surprised to rank the ability to pay as the least relevant factor in this case, particularly in the light of current discussion on the financing of health care. However, each individual seems to have good coverage and hence the real issue is not financial. The principle of justice seems equally difficult to apply because it appears hard to find the *just* criteria (money? social worth? dependents? age? etc.) to discriminate between the various individuals requesting a liver transplant.

Hence I would suggest that the ranking of the criteria should be as follows: 1) medical necessity; 2) beneficence; and 3) psycho-social factors. Medical necessity is key because medical decisions are based on the diagnosis and prognosis of the patient's condition. In this case, each individual appears to have an urgent need for liver transplant, Elaine Valentine maybe the most. That being said, one must also at look the potential benefits. What would be the overall good (to the individual and society)? In other words, how many people would be affected directly and what would be the outcome if someone would not get the liver transplant?

Let's consider Sheila Murray. She is a single mother of three with no other family. How would her death affect the children knowing that both parents are dead? To transplant her would affect directly the well-being of Sheila but also the living conditions (material, social, emotional) of the children. Elaine Valentine does not have dependents whereas I.M. Dei, although he has children, has a wife who could take care of the family (we can assume, in case of his death, he would leave a substantial amount of money).

Finally, in our analysis we need to consider psycho-social factors. One could cast doubt about the mental state of Elaine and wonder whether it would be wise to transplant a liver whose recipient might try to or commit suicide again (hence wasting a liver). What about the case of I.M. Dei? He harvests the fruits of his drug use during his teen years. One might reply that it is difficult to justify such line of reasoning because we cannot hold someone guilty endlessly for past mistakes. Or could we? Indeed, I.M. Dei stopped using drugs and became a good citizen. However, this is not a case of a disease due to the natural lottery. It is a condition he got because he decided to be involved a dangerous activity (drug use). So I would argue that when assessing individuals, all things being equal in term of medical conditions, one should be responsible for the consequences of his/her actions. It would be unjust to Sheila not to take into account her responsible behavior. So based on the potential recidivism of Elaine and the past of I.M. Dei I would put Sheila first, then Elaine (she is in a very serious condition and might recover from here suicidal condition) and last I.M. Dei (his condition is not as serious as Elaine's).

### **Student Responses:**

4.26.07

The first transplant would have to go to Ms. Elaine Valentine the 21 year old college student who overdosed on acetaminophen (Tylenol); she has the most need for a liver transplant. Even though she is medically stable, she is in ICU with progressive hepatic (liver) failure. She needs the liver transplant to survive.

The second transplant would have to go to Sheila Murray the former high school math teacher with three children. She is a single mother now after her husband died, with three children who depend on her. Since she is currently on teachers' long term disability, she is struggling to pay bills and feeding her children. And with this transplant she can get her life back on track.

The final transplant would go to I.M. Dei who is a 48 year old self employed architect who contracted a chronic hepatitis C infection through his intravenous drug use in his teen years. He has private medical insurance that will completely cover the expenses. And if he's gone this long with his liver, he can most likely wait two more transplants.

A.C  
Health Science Technology - Alvin High School

---

4.26.07

I believe the first person for the transplant should be I. M. Dei because it is urgent. His health is declining the fastest. He did cause his own ailment, but has corrected his mistake. He is well educated and respected and has private insurance to cover the cost.

The second person I would pick would be Sheila Murray. Even though she is going to have problems paying the other twenty percent she has her kids to think about. She doesn't cause her body harm and would be a good candidate.

The last person I would choose would be Elaine Valentine. She is young, but she caused her own illness. She also might need help with her depression.

C.B  
Alvin High School HST

---

4.26.07

I base my opinion due to medical urgency and the patient's life dependency.

Sheila Murray would have to go first because she is an only parent caring for three children, and does not have close family members involved because they are all deceased. Mrs. Murray did not abuse her body and maintained a healthy lifestyle without the use of drugs. Luckily for Mrs. Murray, her insurance will pay 80% of the cost and she will only have the other 20% to worry about.

Next would be I.M. Dei. Although he contracted the Hepatitis C virus during his adolescent years, he had the audacity to go to drug rehabilitation and successfully stopped his addiction. Even though he had an arduous history, he was able to innovate himself by becoming a well respected architect and as well as a loving husband and father.

Lastly, would have to be Elaine Valentine. Despite her age and need for the transplant, she was negligent of her own body by overdosing on acetaminophen. Suicide is never the answer for a harsh breakup with an ex-boyfriend. She should know that there are various ways to overcome her dilemma. Like the saying, if someone you love hurts you (in anyway), you cry a river, build a bridge & get over it.

C. C.  
Alvin HS/ Health Science Technology

---

4.26.07

I believe the 21 years old woman Elaine Valentine would be the first to be helped because her condition seems more out of control. Her condition is steadily going downhill, and luckily her insurance can cover 90% of the medical bills.

The second person to be helped would be 48 year old I.M. Dei. His condition has been known of and his insurance can pay for it all. Especially, since his condition has been declining.

The last would be the math teacher Sheila Murray because her PBC is not known all that well and her insurance will only pay for 80% of the medical bills.

S.V.

---

4.26.07

First, Sheila Murray because she is now a single mother struggling to make it and has primary biliary cirrhosis (rare form of liver disease of unknown cause). Having to make it on her own with no family and a dead husband she struggles to make it. Now her liver is failing she deserves a break.

Second, I.M Dei because with Hepatitis C he has made mistakes in the past but has straightened up. Now that things were getting better his liver disease has worsened over the past 6 months. He has made mistakes but has cleaned up and deserves a second chance.

Third, Elaine Valentine overdosed on acetaminophen causing her liver to fail while the other two had no choice. Depression caused her overdose which eventually led to a liver transplant while the other two

had no choice. People that work and try to make the best with their life not end it, deserve a transplant first.

B.B-Alvin High School

---

4.5.07

After reviewing the situations of these cases, I have come to a final decision about who should be first to receive the liver transplant. The first person in line would be Sheila Murray. She is placed as the greatest need because of her deteriorating health, and her family situation. Her disease, primary biliary cirrhosis, was not the cause of any action she took, and therefore could have in no way been prevented, unless the cause of this disease was discovered. She is the sole provider for her family and only care-giver for her children. If she died, there would be no one to care for her children and they would be shuffled into the Foster Care System.

The second person on the list would be I.M. Dei. He is second because his liver problems are the result of his actions. Though they were years ago and he sought help and has become a productive member of society, his liver problems could have been prevented had he not participated in partaking drugs intravenously. He is not the sole caregiver for his children, so there would still be someone to take care of his children if he died.

The third person on the list would be Elaine Valentine. Her overdosing on Tylenol was entirely her fault. If she wanted to kill herself then and had symptoms of depression for the past nine months, what's not to say she would kill herself after she got better and got out of the hospital. If she were given a new liver and then killed herself, it would be a waste of a perfectly healthy liver that could have gone to someone who wanted it and had people that relied on them.

AB-Southwest High School, TX

---

4.04.07

I have based my criteria on urgency of needed transplant, age of patient, dependency on them and on other people.

My first pick for the transplant was Elaine Valentine a 21 year-old college student, she has the most need for a liver transplant. She is also half the age of the other two patients. Her parents have agreed to pay for the ten percent that her insurance does not cover. Even though she has no kids, her parents have some dependency on her.

Sheila Murray, a former high school math teacher is the second choice, her need for transplant is somewhat urgent. She is 42 and has three young kids who are still very dependent on her and would have no were to go if she dies. She needs to be able to go back to work as soon as possible so she can take care of her kids.

The last, I.M. Dei, a 48 year-old self-employed architect has the least need of urgent transplant and is the oldest of the three. He has private insurance that will completely cover his surgery so he probably has good life insurance that would take care of his children and wife if he passes away.

M.R.

---

#### 4.04.07

In my opinion Sheila Murray should be first on the list to receive the liver. Because she has three children ages 9, 11, and 14 and she is their only provider, she has no other family that could care for the children in her absence. She has no background of drug abuse of any type that could cause problems after the transplant. Her insurance will cover 80% of the transplant cost and she will be responsible for the remaining 20%.

Then Mr. I.M. Dei should be second because he did the right thing by quitting drugs that he took during his teen years. Although he did contract the chronic Hepatitis C virus as a result of his intravenous drug use. He graduated from high school and college and has become a devoted father and a well respected member of his community. He also has insurance that will pay for the transplant.

Ms. Elaine Valentine will be third on the list because she acted irresponsibly by overdosing on Tylenol and alcohol. She may also need some help with her depression before undergoing something as life changing as a transplant. She has insurance coverage for 90% of the cost of the transplant and her parents are willing to pay the remaining 10%.

H. C.  
New Diana High School/Pre-AP Biology

---

#### 4.4.07

First, I choose Sheila Murray. She has a chronic liver disease that she will die from unless she has a liver transplant. Mrs. Murray did not cause her liver disease by taking drugs, being an alcoholic, or attempting suicide. She also followed her doctors directions and did everything she could to help her liver get better. Her children have no other family and they do need their mother. For these reasons I believe Mrs. Murray deserves to have a liver transplant before Mr. Dei or Miss Valentine.

Second: I choose I. ME. Dei. He has adapted to his environment by going successfully going through drug rehabilitation and stopped using drugs. This intravenous drug use did cause his hepatitis C virus. Therefore, it was his own fault that his liver failed. However, he does have a wife and children that need him. If he does not get the transplant first, his children do have a mother to take care and support them.

Third: I choose Elaine Valentine. Miss Valentine also caused her liver failure. She may still be suicidal. A liver transplant could be wasted if she took her own. We do not know if she will be a productive member of society. She has no children. Also, as young as she is the doctors may find a way to help her liver.

T.M.

---

#### 4.3.07

I think that Elaine should be the first to receive a transplant, because as of right now Elaine may be stable but there has been no improvement in her condition and she has been in ICU, Elaine also is a 21 year old female with a long life ahead of her and she deserves a fresh start.

Next on the transplant list would be I.M. Dei, because over the past 6 months his condition has rapidly worsened. Mr. Dei also faced a problem when he was a teen but he has received rehabilitation for those problems and has got his life on the right tracks, therefore he deserves the liver transplant second.

Last I would put Sheila, she has lived with her liver problem for several years now and there is no urgency to the condition. Even though Sheila has nobody to take care of her children if something tragic may happen, she has the least amount of urgency to her condition and can stand to wait a little while longer.

J.B.-New Diana High School-Biology

---

#### 4.2.07

If I were really the chair of the Transplant Allocation Committee this case would be clear cut. I would put Sheila Murray at the top of the list, followed by I.M. Dei and Elaine Valentine.

Sheila has been suffering through this unwarranted illness for years and it has definitely taken a toll on her underage children. She still has responsibilities that she needs to take care of and with her absence there would be no one to fill her shoes. She is blameless and the only candidate whose behavior did not in some way cause their condition.

I.M. Dei would be next because of several reasons. He used drugs in his teenage years but has since escaped that tumultuous life style. He was a minor and cannot be held to the same standards as an adult. He is successful and active in the community, meaning that his survival would affect many people and possibly prevent others from following in his path. Also, another factor I feel influences my opinion is that his sins were longer ago and are consequently more forgivable. Time has proven him valuable.

Elaine would be last on my list because a liver would be wasted on her. She is the biggest gamble because her depression might again undulate her and her be attempts renewed. She was older at the time of her indiscretion and should share more of the responsibility of her actions. She is also medically stable, while the others' conditions are more volatile.

J.B.-Southwest High School-A.P. Biology

---

#### 4.1.07

As the chair of the Transplant Allocation Committee, I have carefully reviewed and considered each of these applicants for the liver transplant. Each situation differs in immense manners, and the candidate of primary importance is Sheila Murray. Her medical necessities and the ethical matter of her situation, both outweigh those of the other two applicants. She has three children, a mother being an essential role, especially because of the loss of her husband. She has no one to take care of her children, no family, and they need a mommy to be able to raise them for an extensive amount of time. Her medical condition is critical in which she is unable to work and support her family.

This situation was brought to her in an uncontrollable manner. This medical situation is not a result of any actions she has executed, but of an unknown cause therefore she is not suffering a consequence of her actions, but just a random disappointment in life. The other two patients' decisions and actions have cause them to be in need of a liver transplant, therefore Ms. Murray is the candidate that will hold the first position on the list most importantly because this is completely out of her control.

The applicant of secondary importance is Elaine Valentine, her ethical matters under those of Sheila Murray, but her health condition and psychological matters coming before those of I.M. Dei. The cause for this transplant is because of Elaine's actions, but actions that she made while not in the right state of mind. She was not mentally healthy when she made the decision to over dose, the decision that has deteriorated her liver and put her in the ICU. She is medically stable, but also the only applicant currently in the hospital therefore displaying that her medical state is critical in reference to the others. She has a long life ahead of her, one that should not be ruined because of her unstable mental health. She has two loving parents who do not deserve to lose a daughter, and with the proper help and care, Elaine's mental state can be improved and she can live a wonderful life. She deserves that chance while being in the normal mental state and is therefore holds the second position on the list.

The applicant of tertiary importance in the allocation of livers is I.M. Dei. Unfortunately it has been his actions that have caused the need of a liver, but actions that occurred in his teens. He is a grown man now with a successful job and family, and is no longer a drug user and a wonderful man, husband, father and citizen, and it is unfortunate that his rocky teenage years have caused for this medical situation. He was very aware of the consequences of drug usage at the time he was using, and now it is affecting his life immensely. I feel for him greatly now that he has turned his life around and has a family, and I long for him to hold a higher rank on the list, but because of justice and fairness issues I cannot give him a higher position. He was aware of the drug consequences and it is a devastating situation, but a situation that one must live with. His worsened medical situation is critical, but he unfortunately comes after both Sheila and Elaine, because of his actions, Sheila not having any control over her situation, and Elaine's actions being in the wrong state of mind. I.M. was fully aware of what he was doing at the time he was, and is therefore the holder of the third position on the list.

H.C.-Southwest High School, AP Biology

---

#### 4.1.07

Although all three candidates are well-suited for the liver transplant, they must be prioritized based on not only their conditions, but their ethic principles as well. To receive the first liver transplant I chose I.M. Dei. He has been suffering with liver failure for two years now, and in the past six months it has only gotten worse. He is a very respected person in his community as it stated that he has done many community projects, and everyone knows him. He is in critical need for the liver, for it could worsen even more and in the near future lead him to his death. He has full coverage for the medical procedure, and will not have to pay for any of the surgery. I believe that he is most suitable for the first of the three transplants.

Second I chose Sheila Murray. She is a single mother of three children and can barely get by paying the bills since her husband passed. She has no past record or present record of smoking or drinking which shows that she has respect for her body and plans to keep it healthy, which makes her worthy of the transplant. Sheila's condition has worsened because she cannot comply with her medications, perhaps because she is living off of her teachers' long-term disability checks. She would have to make up for 20% of the cost of surgery but if it means that she is healthy she would be able to go back to work and make a living for her children and herself.

Last for the transplant would be Elaine Valentine. Elaine has developed liver failure because of an overdose topped off with alcohol. Due to her depression she has decided to injure her body and cause major problems with her liver. She is currently in stable condition while in the ICU which means she needs the transplant but can, under careful medical watch; remain stable until she receives it. She is not suicidal which is a good sign, allowing us to believe that she will take care of her liver in the future.

L.M.-Southwest High School, AP Biology

---

#### 4.1.07

Considering the situations these three patients are in, the first patient I would choose would be Sheila Murray. She would be the first candidate for a liver transplant because, as seen in her application, she is struggling the most. She is unable to work so she can hardly pay bills and support her three children. She has no outside support from family so only has herself to rely on. Although being compliant with her medication her health is continuing to decline. By getting a new liver she would still show compliance in taking her medications and taking excellent care of it which would give her a chance to get back on her feet and be able to support her family.

The second patient I would choose would be I.M Dei. Despite his history of drug use, he seems to have turned his life around by going through drug rehabilitation, getting an education, and becoming a successful concerned citizen. Having stopped using drugs he will be able to get a new chance to take care of his liver. Since his condition has worsened in the last six months it is imperative that he gets a liver transplant which would be fully covered by his insurance.

The third patient I would choose is Elaine Valentine. She is only 21 years old and is medically stable for the time being. Although medically stable, she isn't emotionally stable. She has had symptoms of depression for the past nine months and overdosed on acetaminophen only eight days ago. Her liver failure has grown to be serious but if given a new liver, there is no assurance that she will not do the same thing in the future if she starts feeling depressed and suicidal.

A.D  
AP Biology-Southwest High School

---

#### 3.23.07

I think Ms. Elaine Valentine the 21 year old college student who overdosed on acetaminophen (Tylenol) eight days ago first for a liver transplant. Her liver problem is stating that it's very serious and needed to be treated and by that it means the transplant is needed in her situation. She is medically stable, but without signs of improvement in liver function, she's not presently suicidal, and wishes to live. Indeed she has the money to do the procedure.

Then Ms. Sheila Murray the 42 year-old mother of 3 children of the ages of 9, 11, and 14, and a former high school math teacher who was diagnosed with primary biliary cirrhosis (rare form of liver disease of unknown cause) several years ago. She has her children to take care of because she has no one else to watch them for her. Of course she has insurance to cover the liver transplant and additional money for the rest.

Mr. I.M. Dei a 48 year-old self-employed architect with a chronic hepatitis C virus infection (treatment resistant strain of liver disease) which he contracted in his teen years from intravenous drug use, should be third on the list for the liver transplant. In his situation he must have more than one liver transplant because of the disease he has. He has private medical insurance that will completely cover the expenses involving his liver transplant procedure.

E. B.  
Health Science Technology-- Alvin High School

---

3.23.07

I think age would matter if one of them was 70 as opposed to someone who is 21. Severity seems to be the only criteria that really matters. Elaine would be the first one on the list, simply because her case seems a lot more urgent. Her condition is very severe, she is showing no sign of liver improvement, and is still in the ICU. Dei would be the second person to get a liver transplant because his condition is rapidly getting worse. Sheila to me sounds the healthiest. The case record does not tell of any urgency, although it does mention that her liver condition is of an unknown cause. Yes she is dying as well as the other two patients, but to me it sounds as if she can wait a little bit longer. But is that how it would really turn out? Or do all the other criteria such as family status, financial status, compliance, psychological, and overall health really come into account?

B. F.

Economedes H.S./Pathophysiology

---

3.23.07

It's not easy choosing a candidate to get a liver transplant first. There are many things to take into consideration, for example, how severe is their medical problem, their family needs, financial needs, their psychological stability, their compliance, and their overall health and most of all, we must remember to be fair and give justice to all.

I chose 21 years old, Elaine Valentine to be first on the list, for the reason that the hepatologist characterized her liver failure as very serious. In order for her to survive, she needs a transplant. Due to overdosing on Tylenol and drinking half the bottle of wine she has been in ICU for a week with progressive hepatic failure and shows no signs of improvement. Psychologically she's probably the least stable because of what she did. Financially she would be able to pay because her insurance would pay 90% of the cost and the other 10% her parents would take care of. Her compliance after the surgery probably won't be highly expected, but she seems to have her parents support. Either way, she made a mistake. We must give her a second chance.

Secondly, I would choose Sheila Murray, which was diagnosed with primary cirrhosis. PBC is a chronic liver disease that slowly destroys the bile ducts within the liver. She complied with taking her medications but her health has continued to decline. Since she got PBC she has not been able to work and she has been struggling to pay her bills and put food on the table for her three kids that she takes care of by herself. She has no family to help her except for her 3 kids but they are still young. Studies have shown that once patients with PBA get a liver transplant their outcome is excellent. So after she gets the surgery she will be able to financially help her family and be able to stay with her kids and hopefully see them graduate from high school and college. Financially she might get set back because of the part of the cost that she is responsible for, but once she has the surgery she could more than likely go back to work and become stable.

Last I would choose I.M. Dei who contracted Chronic Hepatitis C Virus Infection which he got from intravenous drug use. Although he cleaned up his act and became a well-respected architect he's had progressive liver failure for two years which has worsened rapidly. His severity doesn't seem as bad as the others, his age is 48 and though he is older that should not be a big factor considering his severity. However, I believe that he can wait a while longer and that his Hepatitis C won't get any worse as he waits. Or while he is waiting he could probably be given some sort of treatment to help slow down his condition to where it doesn't progress as rapidly.

B.M.A.

Economedes H.S.-Pathophysiology

---

3.23.07

I would do Sheila Murray first because not only is she a single mother and her husband died and has no close family. She as well does not smoke or drink and would not cause harm to her new liver transplant and would have good use for it as well even though her cause is not exactly sure she would not harm the transplant.

My second transplant would have to be I.M Dei whose conditions have been really bad over the past 6 months he is a father and is living a good life even though he needs the transplant because of his intravenous drug use in the past he could very well have a good use for a new one so that he may continue working and helping the community as well.

My last transplant would be the 21 year old student who has caused this herself by taking those tablets and intoxicating herself and as of now her liver is stable which we could work around but do need to take it into consideration.

I.M.

Alvin High School-Health Science Technology

---

3.23.07

Sheila Murray: First point that I observed is that the disease of this lady was not an affect from a previous action. Unlike the other two patients. She also has three kids whom will be greatly affected if their mom were to pass away. The future for the three children is an orphanage, which will most likely separate them. Although I understand that her insurance will only pay for 80% in this case I believe that you are not saving one life but three. Though it will be hard for the three kids to care for themselves while the mother is recuperating there is hope that perhaps one of their ex-coworkers might help.

I.M. Dei: Although this patient caused for the disease to come aboard, he has repented and changed his course of life. This is a consequence for something in his past. Now he is an active citizen whom wishes to help others in need. He also has a wife and kids whom depend on him.

Elaine Valentine: The failure of her liver was caused by a dumb action that she did not fully evaluate before committing it. I also believe that she could survive a little longer than the rest of the patients. Simply because the event is really recent. I understand that she is young but she does not have kids who depend on her.

A.A.

Alvin High School-Health Science technology

---

3.22.07

After reading the patients applications their medical conditions and life situations, I have prioritized who shall receive the liver transplants. The first patient to receive a liver should be Sheila Murray. Upon being diagnosed with primary biliary cirrhosis years ago, her medication has not been effective enough and her health continues to deteriorate. Not only is her health failing but it has reached the point to where she cannot even work to support her family of three. The reason why she would be the most important candidate would be because she neither drinks alcohol or smokes. She would be compliant with

medications and would take care of her new liver as well as be able to support her children who depend completely on her alone.

The second patient would be I.M. Dei although he has a record with drugs he has battled to overcome it and will continue to battle it to remain healthy after receiving a transplant. Although he has Chronic Hepatitis C Virus infection he would not allow his new liver to go to waste. He is in critical need of this transplant since he has rapidly worsened in only six months. His family also depends on him as well as his contributions to the community.

The third patient would be Elaine Valentine because at this time she is medically stable. She suffers from hepatic failure due to an overdose of Tylenol although she is not presently suicidal there is no guarantee that she will not try this again. She is having no signs of improvement but is stable. Also, the fact that she has no family of her own also makes her the third candidate.

M. C.  
Economedes High School-Pathophysiology