Interactive Cases for October-November 2003  
(closed for comments)

You are a Texas hospital director. Because increased taxes for health care proposed by the Governor did not pass, you asked an external advisory committee to look at your current hospital expenditures and advise you how to manage your resources differently. Otherwise, your hospital might go out of business. The review committee recommended that you eliminate hospital departments that are not making enough money and only offer hospital procedures to those who can pay for them. The first department recommended for closure is the Emergency Room, which loses $2 million a year and is the primary care site for 5000 patient who cannot pay for regular medical care. What would you decide to do and why?

Dear Students:

Thank your for your thoughtful and interesting responses. We received comments from 171 individuals representing 16 schools. Most of you opposed closing the ER or thought that closing the ER should be the very last cost-saving measure implemented. Following are comments about this case and your responses from three professionals who are involved in biomedical ethics.

Commentator #1:

In today's difficult economy we are all faced with the challenge of "cutting corners." As you saw in the scenario, even hospitals are being asked to cut their costs. Many city and county hospitals in the United States provide care for the poor. Often, these patients are seen in the Emergency Room even if the patients' problem is not an emergency. As many of you noted, closing the ER would not only deny these patients access to care, but also might result in deaths when people with true emergencies found the ER closed. Consequently, most of you argued that the ER should remain open and that the hospital should cut costs by downsizing. Others suggested raising money through charity or other means such as bond initiatives and increased taxes. Many communities fight against tax hikes not realizing what services will be impacted by their refusal, as was the case in this scenario. Perhaps attempts to raise money should be more focused as your comments suggest, for instance on taxes or bonds specifically for the hospital system. Finally, some of you suggested that patients coming to the ER for non-emergency care should be re-directed elsewhere. Many hospitals around the country do so now as they try to lessen the burden on the ER. Overall, I was impressed by the broad range of thoughtful solutions presented by your responses as you attempted to deal with the exceedingly difficult problem of allocating scarce resources. You consistently maintained compassion for those in need, which is admirable, while still acknowledging that resources are limited. Thank you for your insights.

Commentator #2:

As more than one student wrote, this is a true dilemma. On one hand: "It really is almost morally wrong to close down the emergency room of a hospital, as it is the place that gives the most needed care to patients in need." On the other, not closing down the ER could also be just as wrong: "Sadly, it could mean that some of the people will die, but many more would lose their lives if the whole hospital closed down." One of the problems for this ER is the fact that it "is the primary care site for 5000 patients who cannot pay for regular medical care." These 5000 patients are not coming to the ER with life- or limb-threatening conditions, but rather with primary-care complaints that should have been treated earlier (before they became acute) in a lower-cost care setting. Perhaps the hospital should explore the possibility of lower-cost primary care clinics conveniently
located in the neighborhoods where potential patients live and work. Even if the patients can’t pay, the hospital's losses can be slashed by providing the needed primary care in a lower cost setting. Or, as a last resort, the hospital could impose a "pay-as-you-go" rule for non-emergency care in its ER. Patients who are determined not to have a true emergency condition can be treated for a fee in the ER or given a list of alternative treatment centers. It's not an ideal solution, because some patients will end up getting no care at all for a variety of different reasons but, as almost all students seem to have recognized, saving the ER for true emergencies should be one of the board's highest priorities.

**Commentator #3:**

Members of hospital boards of directors have a responsibility to maintain the financial well-being of their institutions and to allocate scarce resources in accordance with the hospital's mission. As many students pointed out, while closing the emergency department may be financially beneficial for the hospital, it may also run counter to the hospital's mission of providing health care to the community, particularly if the hospital is a nonprofit or public one. One approach to resolving this dilemma would be to review all hospital programs and major expenditures in terms of their relevance to the hospital mission. Those of less direct relevance could either be scaled back or increase their charges, thereby helping to subsidize the emergency department. The hospital might also seek outside funding to subsidize care for poor patients. This could be done by assisting individuals who qualify for public benefits such as Medicaid or CHIP (Children's Health Insurance Program) to enroll in these programs. Community and individual fund-raising to subsidize the emergency department might also be attempted. Finally, the hospital board could lobby local and state government for expansion of grants for health care for the poor.

---

**Student Responses**

11/30/03

Shutting down the imperative medical branch to a community would cause total chaos. The ER may be a not a profitable area, but it is the most important area of the hospital. If the ER closed where would people go when they had their next asthma attack or tripped down the stairs and broke their leg? The hospital could gather funds for the ER with fundraisers or asking for donations. Discontinuing the ER would be my last resort trying to keep the hospital open.

FD
Wylie High School

11/30/03

First off I would not close the E.R. because although it would save me 2 million a year, it would also mean that people in need of the E.R. might be sent to another hospital and lose their lives because it's too far away. I don’t believe you can put a price on a person’s life. There are many people in need of the E.R.’s services and just because they don’t have the money to pay for it does not mean that they should suffer because of increased taxes. You could cut back on another department or maybe find ways to be more resourceful. Another thing you could do is start a fundraiser. You could have schools and stores around the city participate. Even if you did close the E.R. I think it would cause more harm than good because the E.R. is one of the main departments in a hospital, without it people might stop going to that hospital altogether.
I would not shut down the emergency room. It would not be fair to patients that need immediate care. Some injuries are too severe and cannot wait for medical attention. Also, other departments would end up with the would-be E.R. patients and have to cancel or postpone their pre-set appointments. With all the extra patients, the departments that were financially okay, might lose money because clients decide to go to less busy hospitals. The E.R. should not be shut down. Some patients are able to pay, but they would no longer have anywhere to go either. To make up for the unpaid expenses or to help patients pay, the hospital should try fund-raisers, appealing to donators, or cutting back on high-paid doctors’ checks or unused/unnecessary purchases. They should not, however, only treat patients that can pay as an alternative to shutting down.

C.C.
Wylie High School

Though the ER loses money, it is one of the most critical units in the hospital. Deadly accidents happen, therefore taking out the Emergency Room would be costing lives. For patients who cannot cover their medical costs, I advise a payment plan. Paying in monthly installments for the services rendered. For those who could not pay at all, they have the option to work in the hospital until they are out of debt. Their work would be janitorial and paper-filing. This plan is worth a try before any parts of the hospital are cut.

Wylie High School

If I were a Texas hospital director and were faced with this dilemma I would choose to keep the emergency room in operation. Though the ER would lose two million dollars per year, it could make the difference as to the survival of a patient who has had serious trauma or is in some other life-threatening situation. If all unnecessary hospital expenditures have to be cut in order to keep the emergency room available for patient treatment then that is what will have to be done. And though it is impractical, all patients will be treated, insured or not.

S.B.
Wylie High School

I would not close the ER at my hospital under these circumstances. I could not reject 5000 patients who have real emergencies just to save $2 million. That means each ER patient's life is only worth $400! I believe that each human life has its own purpose, and you cannot put a price tag on it! I would like for the committee to find other ways to cut down on expenses, like cutting or automating some of the administrative services or lowering employee benefits or salaries. These ideas would hopefully help the hospital recover the loss and stay in business.

H.E.
11/30/03

I would keep the E.R. open because that is one of the most important parts of the hospital, most of a hospital's activities branch out from that which happens in the E.R. and it is what practically makes the hospital. Rather than gain money by dropping the emergency room I would suggest the hospital shut down other, less used areas or hold fundraisers to gain money. For if one does not have a place to go to fix an emergency, that emergency then becomes a crisis.

T.A.
Wylie High School

11/30/03

I would not shut down the Emergency Room for two reasons. First, the Emergency Room provides care for emergencies. Without it many would get into worse shape before they could get medical care. Also if a minor injury can be healed in the emergency room before it becomes serious, less work is required by other departments to heal the person. I would most likely look for internal ways of lessening expenses and then cut down on specialized departments.

11/30/03

I would do everything in my power to try to keep the ER open and running with the required amount of staff. I would also try to cut down staff in other areas as well as the ER, do as many fund raisers as possible and try to convince private donators that we need their money to help with the thousands of patients who could not otherwise afford medical care. if these did not work, I would then cut down the staff or intake of patients from another department in the hospital like a cancer center that is not in high demand. the ER is a much needed department of any hospital in any area that is not worth shutting down unless there are many other places to get medical care for the lower class or people who cannot pay for regular medical care.

11/30/03

If I were the hospitals director and was told to close the emergency room because budget wasn't approved; I would fight it in any way possible. Emergency rooms are important because they save so many lives. Without one I feel we would just loose to many people because they didn't get the immediate care they needed. There are some alternatives, you could start a petition then maybe the governor would reconsider the budget. Another solution would be to ask local businesses to sponsor or donate money to the hospital specifically for the ER. If all else fails try to momentarily close the ER until funding becomes more abundant.

L. L.
Wylie High School

11/30/03

As a hospital director I believe it is my duty to help all those that are in need. I would definitely not shut down the emergency room. I would rather go into debt and be begging for money than shut down a room that saves multiple lives everyday. As a director I would try to continually raise money
by having fund-raisers, bake sales, or whatever it takes to keep the emergency room. I believe that you cannot put a price tag on a life so therefore I couldn't shut down the emergency room.

11/30/03

As the director of the hospital, I believe I would look into other departments other than the E.R. The E.R. is where people can come in with any needs and get fast help in serious cases. (well, fast help in some hospitals) Maybe it would be a little bit more reasonable to lay off some of the other departments such as admitting or medical records. The E.R. is too valuable to close down in any hospital.

T.L.T.
Wylie High School

11/30/03

If I were the hospital director, I would not close the emergency room. Even though you don't have any money doesn't mean that you don't deserve medical care. As the hospital director, I would do everything in my power to raise money to help with the costs and cut down on as many expenditures as I could. I would downsize the number of rooms in other areas of the hospital, as well as the number employees.

J.V.
Wylie High School

11/30/03

If I was a hospital director, I would be furious at the suggestion. How could you possibly replace a person's life for the money. If something needs to be shut down, they should go for another department.

M.S.
Wylie High School

11/29/03

What you have to realize is the choices and the consequence that go with your decision. If you are the type that think that closing the ER branch is necessary and helpful to the community in your perspective so be it. Yet I feel if I were a hospital director, I would definitely not shut down the ER branch no matter how much it costs. Peoples lives depend on the nearest ER, their critical conditions is no waiting matter. Also, closing down the ER would result in a horrible situation for anybody.

11/29/03

I don't believe that shutting down the ER would be a wise decision. Many people depend on the emergency room since they can not afford other means of health care. Just because people can't pay for the services given in an emergency, doesn't mean that their life is worth losing. The hospital
should find a more productive way of earning money. There is no reason that innocent people should lose their lives just because the hospital they went to needs money and can't give them the help that they desperately need.

A.C.
Wylie High School

11/28/03

Obviously the ER is a very important contributor to patients, as are other hospital departments. If I were a Texas hospital director I would first as the external advisory committee to close only a portion of each department to help account for some of the hospitals expenditures. This would most likely not account for all of the expenditures, but the rest could be made up for by fund raisers. Healthcare is an important cause and many people understand this, if you inform certain companies they may support the cause and help out. This way, you would not have to close the ER completely and your hospital would not go out of business.

N.N.
Wylie High School

11/28/03

I would choose not to close the emergency room, though it is costing us $2 million a year, it is costing I am sure that there are areas of the hospital that can be cut down to suffice for the operation of the emergency room. Since departments need to be closed, perhaps some that offer facilities or operations that are not used frequently could be shut down until a way of more income is provided.

J.M.H
Wylie High School.

11/27/03

If I was a hospital director I would not close my emergency room unless it was completely necessary. If it got closed down many people in the area that needed immediate attention would have to go to places further away, and that would cause many deaths. Also a lot of people would be put out of jobs such as nurses, doctors, and surgeons. Basically I think that there would be other places that you could close down before you absolutely had to close down the ER.

O.S.B.
Burleson High School

11/27/03

If I were the Texas hospital director I would not shut down the Emergency Room. In my opinion $2 million is a lot of money, I would not close the ER just because the hospital is struggling with money problems. I think that this issue can be sorted out over time, but the problem with people needing help right away and they can't get it could be matter of life and death and that problem can
not be solved. Imagine if you got hit by a car and you were losing a lot of blood rapidly and you went to this hospital and could not give you help because they didn’t have an ER and if you go to another hospital you would die you would be very very very very angry. So in conclusion I’m going to said that I believe that the ER is the heart of the hospital so, if they close the ER they might as well shut down the whole hospital.

CC
11/26/03

If I were a Texas hospital director, I would close the hospitals down. People get hurt and need to go to the hospital. Everyday, humans get hurt either playing, working, or even cooking. There is many reasons why the hospital shouldn’t be closed. I would make every effort to keep the Emergency Room open. Although the Emergency Room loses $2 million dollars, it still helps 5000 people that are unable to pay for regular medical care as well as the people who are able to pay for their treatment. The public relies on the Emergency room when tragedies occur. It would be immoral to make treatment available only to those who are able to pay. On the other hand, there is reasons to close the hospital too. If a hospital is in the business of treating emergency patients, other highly specialized areas the hospital employs should be eliminated and have equipment shifted to another focus or sold to raise capital. Otherwise, the hospital can focus on certain specialties and close the emergency facilities and other common treatment facilities. If a hospital can shift it's focus to another area and become highly specialized in it, the hospital gains notoriety, donors, and publicity. In conclusion, if I were to choose to close or keep the emergency room, I would keep it. The reason for that is because people do get hurt every minute, and it's better to save lives then to lose money.

P.M.
Fossil Ridge High School
11/26/03

I believe that it is tough decision one would have to face because Doctor's we given a oath of some kind that says "hat they will administer the patient no matter the cost and that all people a welcome for treatment" or something like this, but on the other hand one would have to think about their family and see if the could bring in enough money to sustain themselves. It is a tough decision though, but I’d have to say that if the hospital closed down the ER for the lose of money versus the cost of the hospital closing down it would be the ER that would go. Although to solve this problem if everyone in the world just would agree to Doctor’s taking serious pay cuts and that the field of medicine was not so expensive then the ER would not lose enough money to cripple the hospital and the majority of the world would be able to afford going to the hospital. Cause a heart transplant dose not need to cost 50,000. And the technology for its no different than other aspects of life. You could probably study and medical book like Leonardo De Vinci did and practice on some dead bodies. Keep a good heart down at the butcher shop in the freezer and you would probably get the same results. Bottom Line is that the world is greedy and the world will have to pay for it.

J.D.H.
Wylie High School
11/25/03

I will decide to keep the Emergency Room because I think that money is not important as life of a person. Because as you’ve known, a person can make money easily by doing their job, but if the
Emergency Room doesn’t exist, there will be a heavy loss of life everyday. And one of them can be our relative or family member. And I think the patient can not pay their money because at this time, there are many people that lost their job because the company can not pay for them. And that is an acceptable reason for them not to pay money. And the person whose life was saved will have a good attitude about the economic and government, may be if after several year, they become a billionaire, they will contribute their money to the Health Care field. I will fire the doctors that really don’t cure disease for patient, the doctor that just pretend to cure disease, but they just give useless drug to the patient to take their money. I think that the best way to help the hospital out of the difficult circumstance.

TH.B.
Wylie High School

11/25/03

I would not close the Emergency Room if I were a Texas hospital director. Even if we needed money, we’re talking of lives and it’s not worth taking peoples lives away. If you have to close another department then do it, but it just isn't worth it. Find another way for money.

E.B.
Wylie High School

11/24/03

I would keep the ER open because people need healthcare. If the ER was closed how would people be helped? Would they just have to suffer? The workers of the hospital should want to help keep people alive and well. the hospital need to make the patients aware of what is going on with them. I just think the ER should be open to whomever needs it as long as they need it. instead of having to be pushed away.

11/24/03

First of all, all departments of the hospital are essential to the functioning of that hospital. Although some departments, require more expanse than others, all have an important role within the hospital. If I was the director, and was advised to close down the Emergency Room, I would be upset, because clearly that is where thousands of people are treated every single day, and without it many people would have to go around looking for hospital, taking the chance to loose their lives. For this reason, I would ask the community's residents, as well as other businesses to help raise money to keep the ER open. In addition to this, fundraisers are great ways to raise money. And I'm sure once the society is aware of the problem, they will be willing to help, because of the care provided to them form the hospital. All in all ERs are the most busiest departments in any hospital, and closing down one ER, will cause other hospitals to have to care for thousands of more patients everyday, in addition to their regular patients. So I believe that instead of immediately deciding to close down the emergency room, I would try my best to raise money with the suggestions that I previously listed.

B.B.
Wylie High School.
I think they should not close the ER because many people need the ER. Many emergencies happen and there are so many other places you can close that’s not the most important section in the whole hospital. I feel that if the hospital should do anything it should be laying people off. Another option is to just lower everyone’s salary. There really is no price you can put on any person’s life. A life is very precious.

Kayla Gifford
BHS

If I were the doctor that had to make the decision I would keep the ER. Without it many people would die. The ways that I would try to get money would be to get money donations from places and try to get little things that do not cost too much donated from companies.

M.S.
Burleson high school

There is no way I would let the emergency rooms get closed. Despite the fact that there are some losses in the funds for the hospital, people still need proper emergency care. Without the ER open, all kinds of horrible accidents will not get the proper kind of treatment. The lives of the citizens are far more important than a financial problem. People’s safety and care should always come before money.

S W F
Burleson High School

If I were the hospital director I would close down the ER. The reason is because there are always other hospitals around that do have ER, so you are not the only hospital to have one. So it is not a “have to have a ER to be considered a hospital” type thing.

J.H.
Burleson High School

I would not close down the emergency room. I know that there is a large loss of money, but you cannot afford even a small loss of life, but in this case it is substantial. Plus in doing this, you will only be increasing the number of people going to surrounding hospital’s emergency room. Therefore, they will have to close down, also. So in doing so you are not fixing your problem, but hurting the community and the surrounding hospitals.

J A H
I believe that they should not take out the emergency room. What if someone needs it for a severe problem it could mean life or death. So I believe if I was the doctor I would either leave the hospital or try my hardest to keep the emergency room.

My decision would be to do as the committee says. No matter how much it would pain me to do so, I would close the emergency room if I was instructed to. This is so because a hospital with no emergency room is much better than no hospital at all. If you were to keep the emergency room open, then there is a great chance that the entire hospital would close being able to provide care for no one. In a perfect world, you would keep it all open but we don’t live in a perfect world so you do whatever it takes as long as you keep providing care.

I would keep the ER open because people need the healthcare provided. If the ER was closed, where would the people go? The employees of the ER should be willing to accept any solution if it would prevent them from losing their jobs. The hospital needs to make people aware of the crisis. They could raise funds another way, such as private donors. Many people probably are not even aware of the problem, and they would be willing to help the hospital. Are indigent patients using the ER instead of going to the doctor when their problem begins? A low-cost clinic could possibly take some of the load off the ER department and prevent problems before they become serious enough for a trip to the ER. The ER should definitely remain open as long as patients need it.

If I were the director I would not close the ER. Even if the ER didn't make money I still wouldn't close it because it is more important to save peoples lives. You can't just turn your back on someone who needs help. In an emergency it is important to get help as soon as possible and if I closed the ER some people may die before getting to the next one. I would find another way to save money like pay cuts or downsizing the staff.

As a Texas hospital director, I know we can not afford to lose the ER unit of the hospital. You can not put a price on saving someone’s life. I would just have to cut back on some paychecks and maybe lay off some people. Closing the ER would not only affect people who cannot afford regular healthcare it would affect all people who need emergency care. I would cut back on some other
unnecessary expenses and hopefully by following and proceeding with some other steps I can save the hospital some money and we will not have to close down.

C.H.
Wylie High School
11/21/03

If I were a Texas hospital director, I would never get rid of the emergency room. Like the paper said doctors care for 5000 patients who cannot pay for regular medical care. If we hot rid of that, they would have nowhere to go. Before any finial decisions we should talk to the bank. We could get a loan if we have to. Also we can talk to the American Heart Association. I know they would pitch in a little bit. Every bit counts. Also for donations we could hit the restaurants, car washes, and stores. I understand that they are losing $2 million a year, but think about who they are helping.

11/20/03

As the hospital director, I would make every effort to keep the Emergency Room open. Although the Emergency Room loses $2 million dollars, it still helps 5000 people that are unable to pay for regular medical care as well as the people who are able to pay for their treatment. The public relies on the Emergency room when tragedies occur. It would be immoral to make treatment available only to those who are able to pay. As the hospital director, I would look for other areas where cuts could be made. Many small cuts in several departments might add up to large savings. In addition to this, I would seek corporate sponsorships and/or fund-raising ideas. If the public were aware of the situation, a “Walk for the ER” might be a fundraiser where the public could get involved in raising monies. Then the people could come together as a community and not just as patients.

KE
Wylie High School

11/20/03

Because health care will always be needed everyday in society, it is ridiculous and unnecessary to cut down on medical supplies, whatever reason it may be. Just because the tax increase law did not pass doesn’t mean that I would have to sacrifice other people’s lives to save my business. Yes, it’s expensive to run the hospital and each department. And yes, it will be hard to find $2 million dollars a year to provide care for 5000 ER patients. But no, nothing will deter me from giving the best care I can offer to the people in need. I entered this career because I had passion to serve others, and serving others I will. It may sound absurd and close to impossible, but I would at least ask the community to help out. Maybe individual donations. Maybe company donations. And yet, maybe promotions that would spread the news, saving hospital departments. As a result, more people will be exposed to the problem and would take action to maintain hospital regulations. There are always ways around an obstacle, and I will find it soon.

J.N.
Wylie High School

11/20/03

As a doctor with minimum funding I would not close the E.R., because it would leave people out with deadly injuries. If you close the E.R. then your clients would have to find care somewhere that
would accept them. Although the E.R. losses money it is the most health providing center of a hospital and it can give or take life when opened or closed.

j.c.  
Wylie High School  
11/20/03

This would be a very hard decision to make. However, in the best interests of the people, for whom hospitals were created, I would not close down the emergency room. I'm sure there are plenty of other centers in the hospital that are losing money as well but aren't used by as many people. People rely on the emergency room. It's extremely important to those who are critically injured and need help fast. If you closed it, you would have 5,000 people who would be in serious trouble. You would have to question if you wanted to be responsible for that. I believe that the best choice to make here would be to not close the emergency room and instead look for an alternative.

H.R.  
Wylie High School  
11/19/03

I believe that shutting down certain areas of the hospital would do a lot more hurt than help. The statement said that one of the first departments to be shut down would be the Emergency Room area. That should stay open for peoples benefit. Shutting the ER down would only cause problems. And, by not letting patients receive care because they may not be as wealthy as someone else doesn't seem to be a very smart solution either. There would be many people needing help who would not be able to receive it.

R.T.  
Burleson High School  
11/19/03

To close the ER of an emergency room would be a huge disaster, no matter what the cause is! The ER is a place where huge numbers of lives are saved every day! To close this down would be disastrous because it could end up being a cause of many more deaths. They should go to the next department in line that loses a lot of money in one year, but leave the ER alone. It is a vital part of the hospital and of people's lives. People are worth more than money, and there's nothing that can ever change that.

S.M.  
Wylie High School  
11/19/03

If I were a hospital director I would not get rid of the ER. That is the whole reason for health care because you don't know when someone will get hurt and someone every minute is injured and needs repairs. It is your major source of health care. I think you should just cut pay of the other health departments that aren't losing that much money. You will always need an ER because there is always someone getting or you could raise the cost in some of the other medical fields just balance it all out and figure out a way to make more money.
If closing the ER was the only way to keep the hospital open then I would close it. I would direct all patients in need of emergency assistance to another hospital where they offered it. The ER is only a small part of the hospital so it would be worth keeping the rest of the hospital open.

RK
Wylie High School

If I were the hospital director, it would take great convincing to get me to close down the Emergency Room. If the Emergency Room is closed down who will take care of the 5000 people who cannot afford regular health care and the people for whom every second that passes puts them closer to death. I do not think it is fair to these people to close the Emergency Room and what good does a hospital do if it is not helping as many people as it possibly can. If I were the hospital director I would look into saving money another way that does not influence so many people's lives directly.

A.B.C.
Wylie High School

I would keep the ER open for as long as I could. When it became really serious then I would shut down the ER. If I kept the ER open as long as I could another couple of lives will be saved. If I kept the hospital open without the ER I would still be helping people with their illnesses. Eventually I would end up closing the ER for the preservation of the rest of the hospital.

F.P.G.
Wylie High School

This dilemma is one that takes serious amounts of thinking and debating about. To close the ER would be telling many people that there is no longer ready help for them if something bad happens to them. Many people don’t understand how important the ER is unless they’ve know someone who has had to be in there, and without it, they would have lost them. To close something so important to people would be deadly. If it is a monetary problem than there needs to be some sort of charity event or fundraiser to raise the money. If the public knew what was going to happen, they most definitely would voice their opinions and most likely help out. I would keep the ER open as long as I could. Shutting down parts of the hospital, temporarily, that are not used as often until the proper funds could be raised would also be another option. The ER is one of the most critical parts of the hospital and it would be killing many people to shut it down.

J. D. H.
Wylie High School

This is a very hard situation and it might cost us, but the Emergency Room in my opinion, is one the most important rooms in the hospital, so I believe it should stay open. There are patients that might not be so fortunate like others and might not have the money to pay the Hospital like they
demand. Yes I do know it costs money to treat with patients but we don't intentionally get diseases and we don't mean for accidents to happen, so why should a person be rejected because of their income? It just would not be fair for us to take the emergency room out. There are ways to raise money for patients who cannot afford health insurance. We could set up a department that would offer financial aid for those who qualify and a payment plan to those who don't qualify. Another way to set up a charity department for donations.

K.A.
Naaman Forest High School
11/18/03

If I were the Director I wouldn't cancel anything because many people need help in many emergencies so if the 2 miles could save 100 thousand people I think the it should not be canceled maybe just downsized if needed but everyone has experienced tough times and when they need medical help they can count on at least one thing the emergency room.

J.B.
11/18/03

I think that shutting down the emergency room should not even be an option. Every citizen should have their rights to get hospital treatments in case of an emergency. Hospitals need to set up programs for people who cannot afford treatments. I don't think that anybody should get free treatment, but that people who cannot afford treatment should go through some process of paying it back in some way.

BL
Wylie High School
11/17/03

Before closing the ER down I would look for other ways in which I could save money. If that wasn't enough then I would close the ER. $2 million is a lot of money to be losing and it would be beneficial to my hospital to close the ER instead of having to close the hospital. ER is a good thing to have at a hospital but it is not a must.

CL
Wylie High School
11/17/03

Well if I was the director of this hospital I would look at all the options available before making my ethical over all decision. If we did not shut down the Emergency Room it would eventually lose so much money that they would close it. But if they shut it down now, many unhealthy patients would lose their lives or family members. They could go to the nearby hospitals but there benefits to some patients might not be the best that our hospital could have provided. There has to be another way that the ER doesn't lose that much profit. U could take money away from other jobs of the hospital that don't make enough either. But I would keep up with researching other ways to help the hospital stay alive and keep the ER, before I make a final decision.
B.R  
Burleson High School  
11/17/03

If I was the director of this hospital I would definitely not shut down the Emergency Room. I would pick another 1 or 2 wings of the hospital to shut down instead, if it was required. The Emergency Room is the most important wing to the patients in need of urgent treatment. If the hospitals interest lies in the patients and not it's bank account then the Emergency Room would stay open, but if all it's concerned about is the amount off money it brings in then the unethical decision would be to close the E.R.

Burleson High School  
11/17/03

I would not close the emergency room down even if it loses $2 million a year. That is where more than over 5,000 patients who cannot afford to pay for medical care go. We could not possibly take their only medical care away. I would have to think of another department that wouldn't effect as much people. It isn't far to take that away from them when its not their fault they need the medical care.

KMJ  
Burleson High School  
11/17/03

No I wouldn't close the ER. Too many people go through there with life or death emergencies and it is too important to let go. There are other solutions for better using resources. If money is the problem, and the government doesn't want to help, get the community involved. Have fundraisers and have the people that the hospital serves raise the money to keep it running. If they realize that this is their healthcare that needs funding they'll care and help out. Every part of the hospital is completely necessary! We need that Emergency Room!

A.H.  
Burleson High School  
11/17/03

As the Texas hospital director, I would not close the Emergency room. Sometimes people don't have enough money to pay for the bill, but however, money is not worth risking someone's life over or causing a serious injury to get worse. There are plenty of ways that money can be raised to help pay for the expensive costs that may be involved to keep the Emergency Room up and running. For instance, fundraisers and donations are always some ways in order to raise money. I would, and several people around the world im sure, would help participate in raising money for these causes which will benefit individuals who are in need of care, but may not have the money to pay off the expenses at that time and place.

R.D.  
Burleson High School  
11/17/03
As the Texas hospital director, I would never get rid of the emergency room. This is where some of the worst cases come and just because they don't have a lot of money doesn't mean that they should be turned away from getting care. You could offer them banks that could loan them money or try to find some way to get them the money that they need to get help from the hospital. Also, they could look to different foundations for help with whatever problem the in-patient is having. Most of society does not have the money to pay for all these medical bills, that doesn't mean that we should deprive them of help. Put yourself in one of those patients positions, you walk into a hospital with a broken leg, and they can't help you because you don't have enough money. How would you feel? There are plenty of different ways to find money help for patients besides taking away the ER.

J.E.
Burleson High School
11/17/03

If I were the hospital director I would never close the ER down. People who have urgent emergencies have no where else to go but to the ER. Even though it may be losing a lot of money, do something else to raise money. Like fundraisers or even pay cuts. Some workers may not like it, but it is just the choice you have to make. The hospital would die if it didn't have an ER. The ER is like the heart of the hospital. If you close it down where will all the blood go.

CC
11/17/03

As the hospital director, I would never in an instant shut the ER down. The ER is the place where all of the action happens, and where you get your patients. Without the ER, other departments of the hospital would lose money as well. Without the ER, there would be a lack of business, because if you don't have the ER, the ambulances would go to another hospital nearby to get their business done.

A.S.
11/16/03

If I were a hospital director, the last thing that I would close would be the emergency room. The ER is probably one of the most critically important places in the hospital. When someone is severely injured, the first place they go is the ER to get fast treatment. Though the other parts of the hospital are very important also, the emergency room is most helpful. The hospital should set up some sort of fund-raising campaign, of private donors and corporate sponsors, to help those who may not be able to afford the care needed. Just because someone is not financially capable to afford care, does not mean that they should just be sent out on the street to suffer. Unfortunately, people with the most money are getting the best treatment. Everyone should be treated equally no matter how much money they have.

AD
Wylie High School
11/16/03

Closing the E.R. would be the worst thing that the hospital did, because if the hospital closed the ER what would the patients that really needed it do? Say if I had a broken leg and the emergency was closed how would I get care for my leg at the moment that I needed it? Just because some
people can’t pay doesn’t mean that you have to close it.

H.S.
Burleson High School
11/15/03

As the director of a hospital I think the ER should not be removed from the hospitals because hospitals are there to help people in need not to make bundles of money. If the ER is shut down and someone has been shot or stabbed, and is in critical condition then how will they get help? The hospital can’t just sit there and watch them die because they don’t have insurance or loads of money. Now maybe certain thing should be cut off from the ER, but more life threatening things will be treated. The other non life threatening things like ear infection, runny nose, or sore throat should not be treated in the ER. Doctors should be worrying about the amount of money they make, but the health of their patients. Now they should still get paid of course because they work to keep people alive and healthy. So as the director of a hospital even with the loses of money the ER should not be shut down the hospital may save money, but they would not save as many lives and that’s what is important.

CM
Wylie High School
11/14/03

Closing the ER would be the thing to do if you wanted to cut back on the hospitals expenses, but there are other alternatives such as having less staff in the ER and other units that are not used frequently. All of the areas of the hospital are important because you never know who is going to walk through the doors and what condition they are going to be in. However, when doing so you are depriving many sick or injured individuals of the care that is essential to stay alive. Many people depend on the ER when doctors offices are closed and immediate care is urgent. So closing the ER could cause some people their lives.

K.S.
11/14/03

I would not take the emergency room out because it would too highly effect the community. The main responsibility of a healthcare provider is to care for the patient. Taking out the ER would not be considered caring for the patient. That is why I am not in agreement for taking out the emergency room.

W.P.
The Academy of Irving ISD
11/14/03

I would not shut down the ER not mater what. That’s mainly what a hospital is, or made up of. When people think of going to the hospital, they think of going to the ER for treatment ASAP. If the hospital is in debt they need to find another way to fix it, whether its laying off staff, or shutting down another department, but you don’t shut down the ER I wouldn’t think.
A.K.

11/14/03

As the director I would not close the ER, for many reason, for one the er is one of the most important area of the hospital because he are having patient that need medical fast and that why the hospital are for. if we close the ER and there are no t other hospital patient and kill from not getting medical so it would be a wrong thing to close the ER. We can find other way that we solve this problem, for ones we can get donation for the community so that we could have found to keep they hospital in good economical place.

g.o
The Academy of ISD

11/14/03

I would not shut down the E.R. for the simple fact that it takes care of those people that are sick and are in the need of help and cannot afford it. Shutting down the E.R. would be a ethical and immoral matter and would effect the community greatly. The first thing I would do is get the administration together and start cutting the pays back just a little or I would make some of the department that were not as busy smaller by cutting back some of the workers. I would also probably go out into the community and see if I could get help from organizations or business.

j.s.

11/14/03

As a hospital director making such a critical decision like closing the ER would have to be thought of very seriously. The ER is a place where people with emergencies go to for help, I would not close the ER because many people are in need of their services. I would use other resources in order to still have the ER open for example, cutting back on employee salary, maybe cut back on some not so critical job positions and that money could be used to help the ER department. Everyone should be entitled to healthcare, they should not put restrictions on a person's health.

M.B.
The Academy of ISD

11/14/03

If I were the Director of the Hospital I would not close the ER. Instead I would cutback salaries of the staff and administration of the hospital. It would be unfair to cutback salaries of the employees of the Hospital yet administration keep their pay level the same. I would also lay off extra staff that isn’t needed or can be done without. Closing the ER should only be a last resort if nothing else can be done to save the hospital from bankruptcy. This hospital could be the nearest source of emergency care for some people and it would be sad to see someone die because they had to travel an extra 15 minutes to a farther hospital when they could receive care there. The ER may loose money, but you cannot put a price on saving human lives.

E.M.L.
The Academy of Irving ISD
I believe that when in a situation that is as complicated as this, you have to keep in mind the greater good. Shutting down the emergency room will only save money, it will not do anything else for the hospital. However, keeping it up and running for as long as possible and helping as many people as possible will, in the end, have a much better payoff. If I was in this situation, I would keep the ER open as long as possible before other cuts have to be made. Cuts in salary could alleviate the financial problem, as well as layoffs, but no patient should be turned away simply because they have no money. Your job as a healthcare provider is not to make money for your hospital, but to provide care to the people who need it. You must keep in mind the greater good.

m.s.

As the director of the hospital, I would never consider going to such extremes of closing down the ER. Doing such a thing would only defeat the sole purpose of the place. It should be our number one priority to save the lives of those who are in desperate measures. How can we as people who chose to save lives as our profession, one day decide not to due to the lack of payments for medical care. So until we find an alternative way to cut down costs, we will most definitely be running the ER daily.

h.y.
Academy of Irving ISD

Although the emergency room loses $2 million a year, it really does care for many people. Some of us maybe fortunate enough to pay for nice facilities and health care, but there are other people that don't have the care financially and they want some where to go when they need health care, too. You can always solve the problem by closing a facility that is not in as much use that can get help else where and then that would save some money as well. By closing the ER you not only let down many community members but also the people that work in that field of work. In my opinion closing the ER would not be the best choice in this situation.

KKR
Wylie High School

A medical provider's best and most important task is to take care of the patient. Taking out the ER would not give the community the impression that the hospital mostly cares about the patient. If the hospital was to remove it, that would give the community the impression of a hospital crazy for money and not for the care and importance of the community. So if I was the one in charge, I would not be removing the ER. That would be the last thing that I would remove. It's the department that brings in the most people and the people who in most times are in need of the most care.

L.R.
The Academy of Irving
No amount of money lost could convince me to close the emergency room. The ER is one of the most critical elements of the Hospital. Countless individuals come into the emergency room in need of immediate, and in many cases lifesaving, care. Closing the ER is like sentencing those people to death. Even prisons don't put people to death over money. Who here has heard of a criminal being put to death over money? People like drug dealers and gangsters kill over money. Do you wish to put the hospital in the same category as those people? What about the Hippocratic Oath? It states: "I will follow that system of regimen which, according to my ability and judgment, I consider for the benefit of my patients..." not "I will follow that system of regimen which, according to my ability and judgment, I consider for the benefit of my patients IF THEY CAN AFFORD IT!" Don’t forget about the patients. They are the important ones here right? Don’t just turn them into statistics and dollar signs. Closing the doors of an Emergency Room is out of the question SOMETHING else can be done. We just have to try a little harder.

J.J.
Academy of Irving ISD
11/12/03

I would keep the ER open because no one deserves to be turned down from a major emergency just because they don't have enough money to pay for it. If we did not serve those who do not have enough money for care, we would have many more deaths a day. I would have a feeling inside that I turned away people in dire need of help, just because my business was failing. If I did not have enough money to help in a life threatening situation and the hospital turned me down, I would not be very happy with them and I would fear for my life. Everyone deserves the rights of help in emergency situations. "All men are created equal."

J.Q.
Wylie High School
11/12/03

I think it is a bad idea to close the ER. Because is were all the patients that had accidents go there and sometimes they need care without losing time. They could close other department. ER is one of the most important department in the hospital. It might lose lots of money, but it also saves a lot of lives so is like paying for peoples lives to save them.

FO
The Academy of Irving
11/12/03

If I was the director of the hospital, I would rather close the ER than the hospital. Because the hospital is more important and not all the people are going to be in the ER when they are sick. However, I would try to collect money and sell items to help keep the ER open.

H.A
11/11/03

First of all I would like to say I am strongly opposed to closing the emergency room. I don’t like that idea at all. That would be very bad for the people who can’t afford the hospital procedures. But
desperate times call for desperate measures. Two million dollars is to much money lost on people who can’t afford it. It hurts everybody in the long run not just a certain group.

Z.M.
Wylie High School
11/11/03

If I were a hospital director, I would definitely not shut down the ER branch no matter how much it costs. If the hospital stopped providing services to the people who could not afford them and therefore could not offer any financial benefits to the hospital, then that action will bring a decline in the reputation of the hospital in many ways. First of all, hospital does not only mean a profit organization, numerous other values also represent the hospital such as the giving part of the career that is employed in that place. Hospital has the responsibility to treat all of the patients regardless of their status or there would be no purpose for the existence of a hospital because the rich would be able to afford the identical services at home. The first concern of a doctor should be to treat his or her patients successfully, not how much he or she is going to be paid. Besides the disturbance that this action of shutting down the ER will cause to the original purpose of the hospital, it will also be an offense towards humanity which will directly effect business of the hospital. The act of giving with out selfish reasons symbolizes humanity and most all of the patients regardless of their status value this. If the customers or patients feel the professionalism is compressing down on the humanity of the hospital not many people are going to want to support and enroll in that hospital where money and profits are valued more than the life of a human being. I strongly suggest not closing the ER or services which are offered to people who are unable to afford hospital services in a daily basis because that action will cause more harm to the hospital than it will prove beneficial.

N.S.
Academy of Irving ISD

11/10/03

As a hospital director I would not close the ER. Even though the ER might lose the most money but how can one put a price on saving a persons life. What has to be done, it that I may have to start laying off people, or cutting back salaries. What I would have to do personally is, also take a pay cut so that other will see we must all must make sacrifices, and hopefully with those changes the hospital will stay open.

B.N.Y.
Health Careers High School

11/10/03

Closing the ER is a very skeptical thing to do if closing it would be the only option I still would not close it. Peoples lives depend on the nearest ER, their critical conditions is no waiting matter. There has to be other ways to keep the hospital open, you shouldn’t even think of closing the backbone of a hospital. Even though a lot of the people cant afford to pay everyone is entitled to health care.

Lake Highlands Freshman Center

11/10/03
As a hospital director I would close the Emergency Room only as a last resort. Because the emergency room is used by more people in the community then any other department closing it would hurt the hospital more then help it. If any department should close then it should be one that is not used as often or by as many people. Maybe a department like an ear, nose and throat department because there are special offices and sites around town with that kind of medical attention. If you look around the community there isn't really a building or facility devoted only to ER. The hospital is pretty much the only place for that. Closing the ER wouldn't allow people who need help to get it. Closing it would also put many doctors, nurses, and surgeons out of a job. Closing the emergency room in my hospital would not happen.

SMM
Wylie High School
11/9/03

If closing the ER was the only way to keep the hospital open, I would close the ER. Patients needing emergency medical attention would be brought to another hospital since it is not available at the hospital in question. Keeping the ER open would lose money that is needed to keep the hospital open, so other patients can access it. Hospitals are still needed for things other than emergencies, such as maternity and geriatrics. It would be unethical to deny all people in the area healthcare. By keeping the ER open, it would eventually shut the whole hospital down. In the long run, it hurts everybody, not just a certain group.

R.C.
Wylie High School
11/9/03

If I had to make the choice I would certainly not close the ER. First of all it is ethically wrong and immoral. All people deserve healthcare no matter what the cost is. The ER is the most important department of the hospital because it provides immediate care to those who need it. Closing the ER would not only affect people who cannot afford regular healthcare it would affect all people who need emergency care! I would have to find another way to cut costs like closing other departments, increasing hospital efficiency or maybe even lowering the salaries of overpaid supervisors and hospital executives! To close the primary care site of five thousand people would simply be horrendous.

J.H.
Jesuit College Preparatory School
11/8/03

I know my opinion is not very popular but I think that if I were a hospital director, then I would have to close the Emergency Room, that way I would not loose money so I could keep my hospital open, because if my hospital were not open then I could not help thousands maybe even millions of people that a usual hospital saves a year. Plus, if the person has a major injury or illness I would move them to ICU, and the rest could be dealt with like a regular doctors office.

T.P.
Wylie High School
11/7/03

Although we are losing money I do not thing closing down hospitals is the answer. Our job is to save lives and closing down hospitals would do just the opposite. We will have to find other ways
to cut our loses down and to do that we will need to explore every possible idea. I do not believe that we have earned the right as people to decide who lives and who doesn’t. By not treating the people who are unable to pay for medical care we are putting lives in danger. So in conclusion we will keep all hospitals operating and emergency rooms until we can come up with a better way of cutting costs.

L.J.
Crowley High School
11/7/03

First off If I was the director of the hospital I would never in my life shut down the Emergency Room, yes it might not make as much money from its patients but it is also one of the main functional areas in the hospital. I recall coming into the ER and it being packed full of people in need of medical assistance. Some of these people were being rushed in by ambulances or by people driving them there. Medical attention does not come cheap as we all know but when its needed suddenly the Emergency Room is where they go for assessment. To many people are dependent on the ER of the hospital to shut it down, there are too many incidents that involve people being rushed in the Emergency Room as well. Closing the Emergency Room is just down right wrong to do because where would the people have to go if they needed medical attention suddenly. So this is why I think closing the Emergency Room should not be done.

A.K.
The Academy Of Irving ISD
11/7/03

I would chose to keep all offices open because it is important for people, and especially poor people who can not afford proper medical care, to be able to be treated. The ER room is an important place where anyone can be treated for immediate attention. I would allow anyone who needed healthcare, a place in my hospital (assuming I have enough room) because it is important for me and my staff. Our actions say who we are. People would look at us reaching out to everyone and see us as a better hospital. Eventually we would grow out of debt and be recognized for what we did.

J. W. F.
Health Careers High School
11/6/03

If I was the Director, I would not close down the ER because if someone needs medical attention right away, then it would cause problems for them to get medical attention somewhere else. Losing $2,000 a year is better then causing 5,000 to find help somewhere else. Too many people count on the ER to close it down. Things occur everyday and people get hurt, so if they close down the ER, they would have no where to go. Closing it would be ethically wrong, at least that is what I think.

R.D.
Health Careers High School
11/6/03
Being the director of the hospital I would automatically think of my patients and community before money. Although the emergency room is losing vast amounts of money it is a very important part of saving peoples lives. It is responsible for treating people before an accident can get more serious or even lead to death. The closing of this department would force people in the community to travel a longer distance to receive medical treatment this could cause people to lose there lives before they get there. Instead of closing the E.R. down I think fundraisers and local charities could help play a part in earning money. Working out sensible payment plans with people on ways they can absolutely afford. Even though it might take a while for the money to get in money later is better than no money at all. To wrap it up I'm basically saying that it is morally wrong to shut the E.R. down.

C.F.
Mineral Wells High School
11/6/03

As the hospital director, you should immediately realize that the E.R. is one of the most vital departments to any hospital. Many people use the E.R. as their primary care center because they are unable to pay for medical care. Parkland Hospital's E.R., for example, is a huge E.R. and provides a lot of the care to the citizens of Dallas that need immediate medical attention. Closing the E.R. and denying persons medical care for everyday illnesses would result in higher costs to the hospital because people would then only seek medical attention when their medical conditions are at their worst resulting in longer hospital stays and more intensive medical care. Preventative medical care and early intervention are the key to lower hospital costs. As the hospital director I would never personally dream of closing the E.R. because of how important it is to people that can't pay for medical care.

J.G.
Wylie High School
11/6/03

If I had to make a choice, I would not end the ER. The ER is a very important part of the hospital. because it saves a lot of people from dying. Closing down the ER will affect a lot of people. Nothing good will come out of closing down the ER. I don't know why anyone would want to close down the ER. I never made many trips to the ER but I do know people who go there really need some help, and if someone was to close down the ER it would destroy the source of aid for many people.

D.H
J.J.Pearce High School
11/5/03

As the hospital director I would decide not to close the emergency room. The reason why I chose this is because many people depend on that. In many cases it can be a life or death situation. I don't feel that we should take away hospitalization privileges from those less fortunate. By closing down the emergency room it will effect many other parts of the hospital. And what if there was a terrible car crash and over 15 people were injured and needed immediate care and it was past hospital hours, what would they do? Bleed to death? That is why I would keep the emergency room open. I think I would cut back from each section little by little and still give everyone health privileges.
As a hospital director, I would choose not to shut down the ER. The ER is where lives are saved and saving a life is far more important than trying to save money. The ER provides so much care for a lot of the patients. Instead of closing down the ER I would look for other ways to save money like cutting back on superfluous materials. Closing down the ER would be the last step I would take in trying to save money.

I think that we should try the medical health plan just like Canada. People could have gone to the hospital and not worrying about how much they have to pay once they are recovered. Even though it takes a long time to make this work, but, that way, it's convenient to everybody. We don't need important people or government to stands out and speak for us. We are the ones who is paying for it. If we don't like the situation or the fee now, we speak out! Without us, the people won't have anything else to do. Health Plan should be cheap for god's sake. Paying 100 dollars a month is enough, even less. And once when you are sick, you can just go to the hospital...and seek for help. I believe that's what doctors are for.

Being the hospital director, I would definitely choose to not close the ER. Although it may lose a lot of money, it does save a lot of lives. I believe closing it would only make the problem worse because those who normally come to the ER would go to other hospitals who do have an ER and probably stay there as a preferred hospital. I would instead try to figure other ways to make money. One other option would be to consider shutting down other departments.

First, if my hospital were in any danger of going out of business I would take all precautions to diverge this impediment. I would proceed to close the hospital Emergency Room. If the ER were unavailable, more serious cases would have to be taken to another hospital since no ER medical would be available. If funding were to rise again, the ER would open to those who have health care. Although this act is not favorable to most opinions, they simply have not seen the hospital director's view clearly. Most people say they would keep the ER open, even if it were to risk their hospital out of business. If the hospital loses money, employees lose money, and with no employees means no hospital.
If this critical decision was placed in my hands, I would without a doubt choose to leave the Emergency Room. My hospital would NEVER be centered around monetary loss or gain. Isn't the point of a hospital to help people—not only those who are financially stable but all those in need of medical assistance?

T. R.
Wylie High School
11/5/03

Being the hospital director, you should realize that the ER helps so many people beyond comprehension. Closing down the ER could result in a situation where a person becomes eternally ill or as bad as someone dying. If the hospital is running out of money, you could become creative and come up with a charity event of some sort to raise money, instead of closing down a place where so many people can get help and possible cured from a sickness. Closing down the ER would result in a terrifying situation, for anybody.

N.G.
Wylie High School
11/5/03

Money is a big issue these days, and millions of Americans don't have insurance. To close down the Emergency Room (ER), would be a big mistake because accidents occur every day, and if you close down the ER these people would have no where to go when they seek medical attention. The thought of closing the ER would be morally and ethically wrong, but we are all humans, and the first thing we try to do is look after ourselves. Two million dollars is a lot of money but should not stand in the way of helping 5,000 patients. I would like to think that if I were in charge of the hospital I would not close the ER, but before I answer the question I would have to think about what is more important money, or the lives of 5,000 people, and in the end would decide on not closing the ER.

E.G.
Health Careers High School
11/5/03

As the director, I would first find out any other departments they aren't making enough money and see if they are expendable. But I would not get rid of the Emergency Room. To many people need that. Besides what would happen to the people who cant afford it, let them suffer ore even die on the street, I don't think so. I might set a donation thing for people who cant afford it completely. have them pay what they can.

B.H.
Wylie TX
11/5/03

The obvious answer is to seek a second opinion. That is personally what I would do. Eventually, if it were certain that the entire hospital would have to shut down if the Emergency Room was not closed, I believe I would come to the conclusion that some is better than nothing and close it down. The patients not able to receive care at our facilities could be referred, and yes, I do believe that would lose much business, but in the end, a hospital's goal is not in the least monetary, it is to help as many people as possible and as well as the staff is possibly able. I do not believe that the choice to close it down completely and merge with another hospital would be the most advantageous because for those who need a hospital for other reasons than the E.R. should not be forced to
travel a further distance when they could have had a more local, yet "E.R. less" hospital.

A.L.
Arlington High School
11/4/03

As the hospital director, I would ultimately decide at all cost not to close the ER down. I believe without an emergency room, a hospital cannot function successfully. The lack of a hospital ER would require patients with emergency needs to look elsewhere for immediate care. The loss of revenue from these potential patients would ultimately cause the hospital to shut down.

C.R.
Crowley High School
11/4/03

If I were the hospital director, I would not close the ER. I would suggest that the hospital cutback only a little from every section, hopefully stooping the loss of money a little. It would not be right to take from those 5,000 people who could not afford regular health care. Cutting back a little from each section respectively will hopefully still give everyone their health care, without totally taking it away.

T.M.
Fossil Ridge Middle School
11/4/03

If I was the hospital director I would choose to keep the E.R. If the situation got bad enough then I would shut down the next department recommended for closure. The reason I would keep the E.R. department is because it is one of the biggest and most important departments in the hospital. It contributes to the other departments in the hospital because it helps them get business. The E.R. helps other departments get business because some patients in the E.R. might have to go to one of the other departments. So if you got rid of the E.R. some other departments could loose business. The E.R. might loose a lot of money for the hospital, it could decide if someone lives or dies if the E.R. is shut down, because if the E.R. is shut down then the next hospital that has an E.R. might be a couple of miles away and those couple of miles could decide if someone lives or dies.

TW
Arlington High School
11/4/03

If I was the hospital director I would decide to keep the E.R. because it is a very important part of a hospital. I would go to the next department recommended for closure and shut that department down. The main reason I would not shut the Emergency Room in the hospital down is because if you think about it, more lives could be at risk because if the E.R. is closed then that means that the next closest E.R. could be miles away and those mile could depend on if someone died or lived. Another reason that it would be a bad idea to close the E.R. is because it would put many people out of jobs. Even though if you close another department it will cause some workers to be released, there will not be as many released because the E.R. staff is most likely to have the most employees because it is one of the largest departments in a hospital. Another great reason why you should not shut down the E.R. is because everybody has a right to health care no matter if they can afford it.
or not. Even though you lose money with the E.R. if you shut it down you could lose a lot of business in the other departments of the hospital because they could be sent from the E.R. to another department in the hospital, and without that some departments could lose business.

11/4/03

Anyone can see that this is a very bad situation, and would have to be dealt with a very careful and steady hand. The situation really does back you up into a corner. On one hand, you can close the E.R. and many immediate deaths would occur. In the long run, however, this would allow you to keep other patients alive. But on the other hand, you have the choice of keeping the E.R. open. This could make your hospital finally go under if the situation is not treated correctly. My decision for this challenging problem would be to keep the E.R. wing open as long as possible. I would try to set up deals with fundraiser and charity organizations to help set up methods to have money flowing into the hospital, as well as talk to other hospitals nearby to help take some of our emergency patients, making sure they will be properly sustained while in their care. When making this deal, I would make sure the patients and their families knew that they were being transferred to make sure all parties involved with the patient were up-to-date with the happenings of their friends and family. If needed, I would continue to keep this deal open until there would be a way to get more funding into the hospital to make us able to stand on our own feet once again. While this problem is a very difficult one for anyone to deal with, I cannot in good conscience allow the emergency wing of my hospital to be closed to all but the wealthy. The wing was designed for people who severely need care, and I will not turn them over to the cold hands of death for insignificant reasons like money.

M. B.
Wylie High School
11/3/03

If I was the board of the committee, I would highly recommend that you find other ways to cut back on expenditures. The emergency is vital to the society and shouldn’t be cutback. Even if losing all that money you have saved many peoples lives, which should be the greater reward. I realize that if you cant figure a place to cutback on expenditures that the hospital will be closed and with that many jobs are lost. Then many people will also die with Then that creates a bigger problem. You could cutback little by little in each section of the hospital. Cut back on sections of the hospital that doesn’t use everything to the fullest and the patients that need that care can go to another hospital that provides it. The hospitals can work together in this process splitting up the sections for each hospital, That’s if they are near by. The ER provides many people and with that saves many lives like I said before. This is probably the most important department in the whole hospital. It provides more care quickly than other sections. You could also do fundraisers like charities, grants, donations, volunteers. I am sure some people are willing to take some time to save peoples lives. I believe that the last department to go should be the ER. It’s the most vital and where more of the action takes place. I would take that risk of going out of business than cut the ER. Too many peoples lives are saved. I am sure I am repeating myself but I feel like the ER shouldn’t be cut.

A.W.
Crowley High School
11/3/03

If I was the hospital director, I would not let the review committee close the Emergency Room. It
is true that hospitals are losing lots of money each year, but many patients who couldn't afford to pay for their medical care might be really sick and helping people is what hospitals are suppose to do; no matter if patients are poor or not. I think that the committee should look somewhere else instead of the Emergency Room.

A.C.
J.J. Pearce High School
11/3/03

Closing the emergency room would not be good for the community. The emergency room is beneficial to more people than any other portion of the hospital. There are other areas of the hospital that are not used by the majority of the community. I think that it would be best to keep the emergency room and do away with something else.

K.P.
11/3/03

Why would you close the Emergency room of a hospital. I would keep it open and try to find other ways to deal with the budget problems. People depended on the ER for EMERGENCIES that is why it is there, Being the son of a Doctor I have visited the hospital, while my father makes rounds and I have seen that the ER is a very busy place...hundreds of people, rich and poor come in everyday with problems, plus the people who come by ambulance, need the help fast and can not wait hours. Hospitals are there to help you when you are seriously sick or hurt. ALL HOSPITALS lose money due to insurance, the money they need to cover for Malpractice, medicine, and medical supplies. The ER would be the one with the least profit because it does the most work and uses the most supplies. $2 million dollars is a lot of money but what is more important Human life or a few extra bucks in your pocket each month, I for one think it is life.

D.C.
J.J. Pearce High School
11/3/03

If I was the hospital director, I would strongly persuade the committee to look somewhere else to make the cutbacks. The emergency room treats thousands of patients that would be unable to receive care if it was not there. It is our duty to provide care to these unfortunate people. The money this department is losing per year is a substantial amount, but I think that the hospital can make up for it in other ways. Local fundraisers or charities could alleviate some of these losses and make it possible for the E.R. to stay open. I think it is the my job as well as the committee's job to keep the E.R. open at all costs and find another way to raise the money.

M.H.
J.J. Pearce High School
11/2/03

First of all, I am certain that closing the Emergency Room would be the worst solution possible. While it might save the hospital money, the true purpose of a hospital is to help the people that are in need of medical assistance, and because so many people do come to the ER for help we must keep it available. I would much rather eliminate hospital departments that do not make much money. Since they do not make as much money it can be predicted that not as many people need those treatments. So instead of having a department that is only in use half of the time we should
eliminate it and provide more money to other departments. The people that do have the need for the eliminated department can find another hospital near by in which they can receive their treatment. Although it may bring some complication to these few individuals, the hospital would have more resources available for the huge amount of patients that come to either the Emergency Room or the other highly important departments.

CU
JJ Pearce High School
11/2/03

A hospital director has many obligations to not only the people, but the staff, too. It really is almost morally wrong to close down the emergency room of a hospital, as it is the place that gives the most needed care to patients in need. The 5000 people that are served depend on the service that emergency room gives. However, not closing down the ER could also be just as wrong. After all other methods of getting money have been exhausted (donations, grants, etc.), I would have to recommend closing it down. Sadly, it could mean that some of the people will die, but many more would lose their lives if the whole hospital closed down. Many of those 5000 could find other sources of help nearby. A hospital does not only give services to ER patients; others need it to. Saving the lives of others outweighs the cost of not closing down the ER. Even if saving lives other than ER patients were not an issue, it would still be wrong to keep it. Many people would lose their jobs, doctors, secretaries, janitors, etc., and that is even worse than closing it down. Those jobless people could then trickle down into other lines of work and cause the area to lose more jobs. This, in turn, would have a more disastrous effect on the people. After all the consequences have been weighted, I am sure that most people would agree with me that closing the emergency room down would be the best decision. It would be the most productive and ethical choice.

C. M.
Wylie High School
11/2/03

This is a very tough decision to make. But I have concluded that we need to cut back on many things. We will get rid of the emergency wing. If we keep it, all that will happen is we will lose all our money in a year or so, and then nobody will be able to get help. Hopefully, there will maybe be a center established for those who don’t have health insurance, where they can go and receive help.

S.N.
11/2/03

I think that even though the ER is losing money it should be the very last department to close. Where are people who are in dire need of healthcare supposed to go if they have an emergency? I would try to redo the budget and try to find another source of money. I would try to cut costs in other areas and maybe shut down other departments that can send their patients elsewhere. In my opinion, the ER is the most important part of the hospital and is indispensable, and I would rather shut down other departments and cut costs elsewhere. If shutting down other departments or cutting costs isn’t possible, then we have to ask ourselves whether it is better to make money but send people who need help and are dying away or help people and loose money.

A.D.
JJ Pearce High School
I think that if your hospital is losing money and you had to close a department, the emergency room would be the last place to close. The emergency room is the place where patients tend to need immediate care to live. If I were the hospital director, I would definitely not close the emergency room, but would find an alternate solution to the problem. I would find some way to displace the 2 million dollars lost in the emergency room and even close a department where the patients can find care at another hospital close by. I would have to take the risk of going out of business because I would not want to be the reason that thousands of people died because they could not pay for emergency care. Just because a person cannot pay for medical care does not mean they should not receive any.

R.G.
J.J. Pearce High School

If I had to make a choice I would not close the ER. The ER is a very important part of the hospital that is probably the place where most people get aid from. Closing down the ER will affect a lot of people. Not many good things will come out of closing down the ER. I don’t know why anyone would want to close down the ER. I have not made many trips to the ER but I do know people who go there monthly and weekly, and if someone was to close down the ER it would destroy the source of aid for many people.

A.S.
Academy of Irving ISD

They should find something else to do. Everyone will get sick or hurt regardless of how much money they have. And even people who can pay will need to use the emergency room you can't help having medical emergencies.

C.J.
Wylie

To tell you the truth I would not close the Emergency room. There are many reasons that come to mind but foremost is the amount of money people have now-a-days. When the Economy is weak everyone expects to suffer a loss, even hospitals. Insurance rates are so high that nearly 33 % of the people can’t afford insurance and on top of that doctors charge so much. A person needs the emergency room where he can go and by the a doctor goes in the field to help out a person. Money should not be a motive it is just a reward. So the emergency room no matter how much loss it is accumulating should stay open and another plan to cover losses was to ask the doctors to pitch in a little money to cover the cost and every thing would be fine.

Z.K.

in order to avoid closing the hospital something would have to be done. Closing the emergency room is not the answer though to maybe people depend on that for medical emergencies which happen all the time. not treating people who have no way of ever paying for the treatment seems like a good idea though.
I personally feel that no matter how poor a person is, his right to well being and health care should not be restricted. If we take away the poor person's right to health then soon we can take away the poor person's right to education. The two are not far off; one represents mental well being and the other physical well being. If we cannot provide proper care for all members of society then we are not truly a democracy. Even if the hospital should go out of business, it is better to die with nobility then to compromise one's ethical beliefs.

Z.G.
The Academy of Irving ISD

In this case, I would rather close down the emergency room down to keep the hospital up, rather than keep it up. What you have to realize is that there are hundreds of other hospitals that possibly may not have the same complications as this certain hospital. 2 million dollars a year is a lot of money and of course that is not measurable to the 5000 patients who will be let down with the closing. But the fact of the matter is, with the whole hospital going down, many other patients will be turned away in other departments and also, many of the patients currently being treated in the hospital will have complications. You have to look at this situation from abroad and consider ALL possible complications and make the decision that will help the overall outlook of the hospital AND the patients. So if I was the Texas hospital director, I would definitely close the ER and try to keep the hospital alive.

S.P.
Garland High School

I believe that the Hospital should do what it can or must to keep it in business. If you take away the emergency room, it would only affect the people that need the Emergency Room. On the other hand, if you don't get rid of the Emergency Room, then the whole hospital will go out of business, and then it would be a big problem for more than just the people in need of the Emergency Room. Patients would have to be moved, Doctors would be out of a job, and there wouldn't be a hospital near by the people in that neighborhood anymore. The Hospital can raise money quicker and faster without an emergency room, so the removal could be temporary. There also may be many active citizens in that community that may be willing to do a fund raiser for the emergency room if they feel that the emergency room is necessary.

B.L.
Garland High School

I think that it would not be wise to shut down the emergency department. This is were lives are saved and also lost. 2 mill. is a lot of money but, I would rather lose money then lives. The emergency room is for emergencies, and needing immediate attention to your health but not having any money is an emergency to me. The government needs to take a look at other departments to shut down before you shut down the emergency room because other things can be prevented but emergencies can not. You never know when an emergency is going to happen to you... Would you want to be turned away from the hospital if you had no money but were dying??
J.I.
Garland High School
10/30/03

One must realize that a hospital is still a business. To survive a business must make a profit or minimally break even, losses are not acceptable for a business’ survival. If the emergency room is losing the most money, then that, from a business standpoint, is the most logical area to cut costs first. One must consider that the Emergency Room’s availability is important to many people. Although healthcare should be available to anyone in need, it is very expensive and must be paid for. The money needs to come out of someplace other than the non-existent budget of the hospital. If no extra funds can be conjured up then it is reasonable and logical to close the ER rather than go bankrupt rather than let the entire hospital close.

R.M.
The Alexander School
10/30/03

I think that closing down the emergency room will be a bad mistake and choice to make. I believe that it will be a bad decision because the emergency room is where patients come to seek medical help and assistance. The medical room is also where patients can come to get help with medical insurance or no medical insurance. I personally believe that saving a life is far more important than trying to save money. I know that two million dollars is a lot of money, but saving a life is more important. So I hope that they make the right and best decision by not closing down the emergency room.

S.S.
LHFC
10/30/03

After reviewing the information provided, as well as doing my own research, I believe that closing emergency rooms may help our hospitals with their current financial situation. Although hospitals help quite a few bit of people it is still a business, not charity. Hospitals not only have to pay employees but they have to be able to function as a hospital. I would rather be rerouted to a different hospital than go to a closer hospital that is not properly equipped with equipment to medically help me. Hospitals have to pay bills, salaries, by new beds when necessary, bed linens, towels, cleaning equipment, and tons of other things. 2 million dollars may not seem like a lot of money for a huge hospital, but when you think about what it takes to run a hospital 2 million dollars could come in handy. California hospitals lost a total of $325 million dollars last year, because of people not being able to afford Medicare. K. W. mentioned in his/her 10/23/03 post that maybe fundraisers could help with the money deficit, which seems nice in theory, but in all actuality I cannot think of a fundraisers that will help repay $325 million dollars. Unless it is a life or death situation people who can afford treatment should be treated first. This method insures that hospital knows who and who cannot afford treatment, and they receive proper payment for their services. It may seem wrong to treat only people who can afford treatment, but it is also wrong to have to explain to employees that they are having to take a pay cut because someone didn’t have enough money to get treatment, but they treated them anyway. Maybe we could find a solution if hospitals joined together to form a bigger hospital, there would be more employees and supplies for both hospitals. Or if information was given to people about when it is necessary to come to an emergency room and when it is OK to go into a doctor's office.
Like most things dealing with business in general, the desire to cut services when revenues fall short remains the primary option. Sadly, this option is shortsighted at best. If the emergency room or any other services were to be cut, it is hard to envision a period in time when that section of the hospital could be reopened. The immense expense incurred when reopening a dormant facility would likely be counterproductive. The rehiring of doctors, purchasing of new equipment, etc. actually costs more in the long run. A full audit of the hospital's functions should first be immediately executed (no pun intended). All government programs have immense amounts of waste and bureaucracy that could either be eliminated to farmed out to private contractors to reduce costs. Though these cuts alone would likely not fix the problem itself, it is a good start. Next, the focus of the hospital itself should be determined. Children's Medical Center of Dallas is undergoing a $150 million expansion due to its focus on certain highly-skilled fields (separating twins conjoined at the head and others). If a hospital is in the business of treating emergency patients, other highly specialized areas the hospital employs should be eliminated and have equipment shifted to another focus or sold to raise capital. Otherwise, the hospital can focus on certain specialties and close the emergency facilities and other common treatment facilities. If a hospital can shift it's focus to another area and become highly specialized in it, the hospital gains notoriety, donors, and publicity. When tax money returns (most likely soon, as exhibited by 7.2% Q3 GDP growth), the hospital can return as a more efficient and focused business enterprise. Consequently, the hospital gains more flexibility when it wants to reroute money to programs or expand. Finally, an effort should be made to lobby the state legislature to protect the interests of the hospital and medicine itself. Emphasis placed on tort reform, which would eliminate frivolous lawsuits aimed at putting doctors out of business, helps lower the cost of medicine and care all around.

The situation of the hospital is very unfortunate, but I feel that not all options have been exercised. A simple tactic to create political pressure would be to take the situation to the media. A simple news conference could greatly influence public support and create political pressure on the state legislature. Also, closing the ER is ludicrous and the hospital would become a large doctor's office of specialists. Through manipulation of profits in other areas of the hospital, different branches of the hospital could compensate for the ER's deficit. Also, the ER should eliminate wasted care. Many patients rush to the hospital but their doctor or a clinic could provide the same care at a lower burden on medical resources. If these measures fail, it is the goal of the hospital director to keep the hospital in business and provide the greatest good. While poorer citizens may not be able to afford medical care, many charities will make up the difference and at least a few patients can receive care.
I believe that the only option is not to shut down the Emergency room or go under. I think about the Scottish Right Hospital near my city. In front of the hospital there is a place called the Ronald McDonald House. In this house parents are allowed to stay for little to no cost depending on the given persons situation. As the administrator of the hospital, I would begin to contact big companies and ask for sponsorship in order to stay open. I may also ask for the companies to donate items that I could put in a silent auction to gain money for the hospital. Big Companies need to give so much money a year to charities in order to not have to pay large taxes. In my search for sponsorship I would of course try the soft drink companies first. I would offer them exclusive control over our vending machines. I would make a public announcement asking for donations to the hospital so that it may stay open and serve the people who truly need it. People will usually find a way to give what they can't afford to charities that truly need it. There are other options to consider than just shutting down the public means of health care. I would do all that I could in order to prevent the E.R. from being shut down. But if all my work proved to be in vain and the E.R. continues to lose too much money, I would be forced to shut it down. Granted that many people may no longer be able to get medical treatment, but what about those that can afford it or do have insurance? They should not lose their health care because of the recession in the economy. These people would need treatment and it would be better to be able to treat few than none at all. A hospital is a business for medical care. It must do what it can to stay open. So I would first attempt to raise money through charity, but if that fails I would have no option but to shut down the emergency room.

T.G.
Garland High School
10/30/03

If anything, closing down the E.R. is the last thing I would do. There's a reason why it's called the Emergency Room, people come in cases where there's an emergency. Not everyone that walks through those doors is poor. People could be dying, and what if they can't make it to the next closest hospital? If anything, I would go to the next section of the hospital that is the least used and cut that. Although it still doesn't make any sense to cut out any part of a hospital; hospitals are here to help people. If you cut any part out, it's like cutting out a body organ. You need every part to be alive. If you have a stomach ache, you're not gonna go cut out your stomach to get rid of the pain.

P.M
GHS
10/30/03

If I was the director of a Texas Hospital, I would do everything I could to keep the emergency room open, however, we all know that with no money it is impossible to keep a successful business (in this case an emergency room) running. I would do everything in my power too keep it running, however, it is impossible to come up with 2 million dollars selling chocolates (fund raisers). Perhaps if you could reduce the superfluous materials in the rest of the hospital building it may be feasible to build up a surplus of money that would cancel out the extra expenditures that do not generate a revenue of money. If there is no way to come up with enough money to fund the emergence room, you have no choice but to eliminate it.

T.R.
10/30/03

Parts of the external advisory committee's plan works. Somewhere money must be saved in order to keep the hospital open. The hospital's complete closing would be more harmful than just the
elimination of a few departments. Sure, by eliminating emergency we bring harm to 5000 people, but how many use the hospital? It’s the principle of utility: if more people use the hospital total than those that just use the emergency room, and by closing the emergency room you better provide for the greater number who use the remainder of the hospital, you are morally obligated to close the emergency room. Of course, if the emergency room helps more, then you must keep the emergency room and eliminate other lesser used departments. As to only offering service to those who pay... it may be necessary if there aren’t enough underused departments that can be closed to generate spare cash, but you can always look at each individual case to deem who needs the free care most. There is no clear yes or no answer (this is why its an ethics case), but a balance can be achieved based on serving the greatest number possible with available resources.

J.B.
Garland Highschool
10/30/03

First off, we must consider what is more valuable in this case: money or life? I personally vouch for life over all else. Because the Emergency Room the section being debated, I feel that there is even more reason to keep it up. This wing of the hospital helps those patients who are in immediate need of medical attention, and life is often at stake. As a doctor, you commit yourself to saving/preserving life, not worry about making excessive money. As a hospital DIRECTOR, I would be representing all doctors and nurses in the hospital; on their behalf, I cannot bring myself to fail the people who count on much needed health care. In fact, many people cannot afford health care; would you close off ALL health services to those who cannot pay for it? There is never a shortage the need for doctors and nurses in this world. Even IF the hospital were to close, they can find jobs somewhere else, and both professions pay well enough. Now consider the alternative: you cut off the Emergency Room wing and MAINTAIN $2 million, not PROFIT. What if the hospital continues losing revenue and ends up closing later anyways? One human life is priceless; imagine losing five thousand. I firmly stand on keeping the Emergency Room open to those in need, regardless of whether they can afford it or not.

H.L.
Garland High School
10/30/03

Closing down E.R. should not be the primary consideration for closure because it would harm many people who are in need. If spending $2 million to save the lives of many people in emergent situation were waste, then closing down would be a good idea. But lives of people are far more expensive and precious than $2 million, despite what the review committee might think. The previous student's response that “a general surgeon or M.D. could be the judge of those who request ER room clearance” isn’t a good idea because that would slow down ER (already slow enough) and thus make ER inefficient. In that sense, ER would lose its purpose. Also, stopping cares for those who cannot afford would defeat the purpose of hospitals: service. Hospitals should not be considered as a “business” as said in the ethics topic because hospitals are non-profit organizations. “Only [offering] hospital procedures to those who can pay for them” is discrimination because that would preclude low class people from getting health cares. Hospitals are needs, not wants, and therefore taking away the needs of people would be unjust.

There are other alternatives other than closing down ER, such as working harder to pass the bill or asking government for help. Instead of thinking about cutting services, why not think about cutting some of those over-paid paychecks of doctors? Why not put the “service attitude” into
I'm very disappointed to see that the majority of the people here aren't looking at both sides of the issue. Of course, at first glance it looks like keeping the emergency room open seems like the right choice, but there is another side to this issue. By keeping the emergency room open, the hospital will continue to lose money and will eventually have to close down. By a hospital closing down, more lives will be lost because there is a lot of people that need help that is not an emergency. I'm not saying that I would shut down the emergency room, but I think that if there is no other option, then it would be in many peoples interest to shut it down to save the other wings. 30 hospitals have been shut down since 1980 and many people with disease such as osteoporosis would have to travel a lot further if they broke a bone. Women who are in labor, it is important to have a hospital close by so that they can have a safe delivery. If a close hospital shuts down, complications could happen from the extra time spent driving. Also if a hospital shuts down, many people would be out of work. The state only gives them 90 days notice before a place is shutdown. If only the emergency room was closed, many of them could be transferred to another wing of the hospital. If the whole point of a hospital is to save lives, we could save a lot more by keeping a whole hospital, rather than just trying to keep the emergency room open for a little while. I think that the idea of fund-raising is a good idea in concept, but I don't think that it would work in the long run. Insurance rate is very low right now, 71 cents per 1 dollar, and the economy is horrible so its hard to get money from anywhere. A possible solution is that the doctor would not make such a profit, but based on the human nature of greed, I have a hard time believing that would happen. I like what BW had to say, and I agree with their idea of trying to help the most people possible. Also I think that MR had a good idea on looking at the bills and considering all of the options, and also recognizing that because this is an ethical issue, there is no right or wrong. I was surprised at what MT said, because they seemed to be more concerned about their career, than all of the needy people. All of this is just my opinion, and I just want everyone to look more closely at both sides of the issue.

LW
The Alexander School
10/30/03

If I was a hospital director faced with that decision, my choice would be not to close the Emergency Room. I strongly believe that doctors should be doctors because they care about people, not because of the money. There are many people in this world that can't afford the medical attention they need, and the ER is the only hope they have. How could a human be willing to deny someone medical care, and basically let them die eventually. I don’t believe that's right. Even if the hospital was going to close if the ER was not shut down, I don’t think that would be a huge problem. First of all, if that is the only hospital within a city, the city isn’t going to shut down the hospital. Everyone needs medical care at sometime in their life. Citizens would know and understand the importance of having that hospital and would help fight for its survival. Whether the citizens donated money, or even helped the hospital set up a fundraiser, the hospital would get its money. Also, if there were many hospitals within that city and closing it wouldn’t be a problem, then all they doctors currently working at the hospital that would be shut down, could find another hospital to work at. There are always hospitals needing doctors.

S.T.
J.J Pearce H.S
Confronted with such a predicament, the hospital director has to realize his or her motives for running this hospital. Although the ideal motive is philanthropic, there is usually some hope of profit from running such a public service. I am on the philanthropic side 100%, but I don't have a family to feed and support. It is logical to get rid of the emergency room in light of its affiliation to the retrogression of the hospital's expenditures, but then what is the difference between the U.S. and underdeveloped countries? What is the purpose of having a hospital that can't serve the most needy? The director really should just find a way to get better profits from that department and take out one that is a smaller commodity to the general public. A hospital in itself should represent hospitality in a professional, business-like manner. There is always another way (in most cases anyway), and in this case, I highly recommend the other way because, otherwise, this hospital director is defeating the purpose of the hospital.

S.S.
Garland High School
10/29/03

In this scenario, the hospital director is placed in a difficult situation in which the outcome of his decision will have a significant impact on the future direction of the hospital. If the director chose to cut the emergency room division, then the hospital would become less of a hospital and more of a private practice and specialty center. Because specialists are so expensive and sought after typically by those who can pay for them, then the latter type of medical establishment would be more lucrative for the director. If I were to ever invest in or direct a hospital, I would want it to be primarily and establishment for care giving and helping the community as much as possible. This is why if I were the director, I would instead opt to reduce the size and scope of the specialist's wings and maintain the budget for the Emergency Room. The correct answer in this situation depends entirely on the hospital director, where his/her priorities are, and how they envision the future of their medical establishment. In my opinion, this problem can be solved at the highest level by reducing the amount of government waste and disciplining fiscal responsibility without increasing taxes. If there is less money wasted through the other branches and departments of the government, then there would be more money to spend on public needs.

L.G.
Garland High School
10/29/03

I think that closing and shutting down the emergency room will be a bad choice. I feel that it will be a bad decision because, that part of the wing receives a lot of patients that can either afford the visit or cannot afford the visit. I know that two million dollars is a lot of money to lose, but I think that saving lives is more important than money for any cost. I strongly believe that to save a life or helping someone should not come at a price.

C.C.
10/29/03

I feel that if I was the director and I was faced with this decision, I would definitely not close down the emergency room. If I was to close any area of the hospital down, that area would be the very last. Yes, even though it does loose a lot of money the emergency room, I believe is more important than a patient being in a private room. In order to limit the amount of money the emergency room losses, I would raise the prices of other procedures such as: receiving surgery, being on life
support, and patients which have minor injuries or irritations. The patients that did come in and could not pay the whole price of what they have received, I would allow them to pay at least five dollars; because something is better than nothing. I would also make the patient pay before they are helped. Even though it may seem unfair for others to pay more than some if you want to be helped and treated then you just have to suck it up and pay the price.

S.H.
Garland High School

10/29/03

I agree that money keeps hospitals going and that a part of the hospital might need to be shut down, but I don't think that the ER should be the one to go. While the ER might be losing the most money, it probably helps the most people, which is the main idea of the hospital anyway. As far as which departments of the hospital to shut down, I think they are all important, but, if need be, get rid of the ones that help the least people or that are the weakest at the hospital. Only allowing people who can afford it to get treatment just is not right, but it might have to be done. If it got to the point at which people could not be given treatment without paying, then the hospital would have to turn people away. Without money, the hospital does not work. In a world in which people are perfect, it wouldn't be an issue. The richer people would give money to the hospital and the hospital would have endless supplies and machines and money, but it is not a perfect world and sometimes to get by, people have to do things like turn sick people away; things they don't want to do. But they have to.

A.W.

10/29/03

I believe that it would be a bad choice to close down the emergency wing of the hospital. Many people don't have very much money these days and they may not be able to pay for the medical treatment they need. The emergency room would allow them to get better with little or no money. Two million dollars is a lot of money to lose, but I believe that losing the money is better than losing the lives. The hospital could raise money to keep the emergency room running, too, so then everyone can get the treatment they need.

L.J.
The Academy of Irving ISD

10/29/03

Well hospitals are made to help people in any and every way ..... 2 mill is a lot of money ....for a hospital... and 5000 people that didn’t pay is a lot of money ....Doctors are one of the main important jobs in the world without them everyone would be sick or hurt or even without medications to help them get better. So what I have to say is that no matter what the problem is that the doctors have to be there and help the patients out in any problem......they have .. the hospital has to treat people = even if u have insurance or don’t....

C.L.

10/29/03

I don’t think they should close down the ER, because most of the people who go to the hospital today don’t have enough money to pay. by closing down the ER there won’t be any place for those
people to go. They will have to pay these high doctor bills for private doctor that they can't afford.

K.G.
Academy of Irving ISD
10/28/03

If I were in charge of a major hospital whose emergency room was causing my hospital to take a turn for the worse, I would never take away the emergency room. This is a very simple reason why; either you help someone in desperate need, who may not have all the money needed to pay off medical expenses, or you let that individual die. Now it may just be me, but aren't hospitals supposed to save lives? To deny a human being of their desperate medical needs is, in my mind, a greedy murder. Greedy because it is helping you, and only you, make money at the cost of another's life. Either that hospital needs to realize that the emergency room may not make them the most money, or they need to go out and purposely hurt people so that their greedy selves can make some money off of their emergency room. I think that my answer is clear enough, you have to keep the emergency room.

S.O.
10/28/03

2,000,000 dollars lost to 5000 patients a year that cannot pay for Medicare is an atrocious sum. There is over 260,000,000 people in the U.S. alone, not including illegal immigration everyday. Many of the ER department rooms are filled with minor injuries such as headaches and the flu. These could be prevented at home, without the additional hospital use. The ER room could be seriously downsized if the public only knew of how to treat common problems appearing serious to the normal eye. As a solution, a general surgeon or M.D. could be the judge of those who request ER room clearance. If they are seriously injured, they are wheeled to the ER. If the problem is not immediate or desperate, they may be held in a nursing room under one hour surveillance of serious problems. This would reduce the stress of the ER such as seeing other injured patients wheeled by, or hearing the shouts and screams of victims/doctors/nurses in the room near yours. This action could be considered drastic, but in the wake of losing a public service such as a hospital, measures must be taken.

Dan
LHFC
10/28/03

I think that with so many businesses running low on money many are making the unfortunate mistake by cutting out the most important parts. Hospitals are there to help people and if one is so desperate for money that it is cutting out its emergency room there is obviously a bigger problem than just money. Yes, emergency rooms might be where the majority of a hospital loses it’s money but it is also where the majority of people in a hospital go to get help, which anyone should have the opportunity to get whether they can afford it or not. If a hospital really is losing such a large amount of money they should downsize on parts of the hospital that are used the least.

BD
Lake Highlands Freshmen Center
10/28/03

While a hospital's main purpose is to help people, and not to make money, if faced with bankruptcy, the owner has no other alternative than to close the E.R. By closing it and retaining other services,
he can still, at least, help some people. The prompt stated that this was the first department recommended. That said, I would look at the other departments that could be closed and determine which scenario will enable the least amount of closure while still being able to help the most people. The idea to not give hospital care to those who cannot afford, at first, seems absurd, but on examination, seems reasonable, given the fact that, in a capitalistic society, profits drive business. If this is the only way for the hospital to stay in business without closing any departments, then so be it. If the people insist the hospital stay open with no services closed, despite the hospital losing money, then they should have to pay the price to cover these costs. If this does not satisfy those who cannot afford basic healthcare, they could lobby for an increase in government subsidies. The government should take a close look at its waste programs and find things to eliminate in order to be able to contribute more to the hospitals. A crack-down on welfare subsidies might be a suggested start.

B.W.
Garland High School
10/28/03

Any citizen of the society in which we currently find ourselves would be shocked to hear any proposal related to the closure of an Emergency Room. This in itself is a valid reason not to follow through with any such plan. Any hospital intending to close a security on which so many depend would no doubt meet with serious opposition from the general public. The only advantage any hospital facility has over any other is its location, and this is only truly a benefit in circumstances of dire emergency. If the Emergency Room itself were unavailable, what can only realistically be viewed as customers might take their business elsewhere, thereby possibly undermining the productivity of the hospital more than the facility originally did. In addition to the unethical nature of such a plan, it would have a high chance of being counterproductive.

JM
Wylie High School
10/28/03

This is a very hard decision to choose from. What it basically comes down to is that do you want to help save the 5,000 lives, or do you want your business to gain more income. We should all want to help people at all times. Many places (for example The Red Cross and angel trees) help people that are not as fortunate to gain things that they could not afford if it was not for other people who had compassion to help. The Emergency Room though is a very necessity for a hospital. What if you become sick too quickly to get an appointment, or you suddenly became sick in the middle of the night? What would you do? You would probably go to the Emergency Room. I at least go to the Emergency Room once a year, and I am very thankful that it is there for me in case I may need it any moment. I mean, what would have we done during the 9-11 attacks if there were no Emergency Rooms? Most of those people would have probably died if it were not for the hospitals combined effort to save them. Yes, the hospital may need more money, but they could also raise the prices or find cheaper equipment and utilities companies to help lower the costs. The hospital may lose money due to the Emergency Rooms, but the cost of the lives is a greater loss.

S.B.
Wylie High School
10/28/03

Although the Emergency Room is losing an extraordinary amount of money I don’t think shutting the Emergency Room down should be an option. In society today the lower class is quite high and
without an Emergency Room what would happen to those people when they need help and don't have money to afford proper medical care? Obviously a 200 million dollar loss is a big problem but, 5000 people going without medical care should be the bigger problem. Peoples lives should be the first priority in a hospital, not the money. I do realize thought that there is a possibility of the hospital shutting down but, I think there are many options in increasing the gross amount of money. For example, funding from other companies, fundraisers in the community, collecting donations, and making budget cuts.

S.N.
LHFC
10/28/03

I, as the hospital director, would not close the Emergency Room. The Emergency Room serves too many people to be closed outright. These people depend on having twenty-four hour service, all the time; in case of emergency. The other reason is that not all people can pay for insurance. These people come to the ER because they need medical treatment. Of course, there will be the occasional person who does not need medical treatment, or is not even sick. One of the ways to stop that is to get a better triage. I think, as hospital director, I should examine all costs from all departments, and then do away with un-necessary costs. From that point, I would down size the departments, keeping in mind the ones that need more people, and try to fundraiser additional funds. This solution might not be worth two million, but it sure beats closing down.

10/28/03

As a hospital director, I would have a serious problem closing a department. Terminating the Emergency Room of my hospital would probably be the downfall of my career. Hospitals were made to help everyone in need, not just those who have the time to make appointments and who are capable of paying up front. The ER of a hospital is perhaps the most important department within the building, so closing it would endanger the community as a whole. Doctors would have to find new jobs and those with serious traumatic injuries would be turned away to find a new place of treatment. I am currently involved in a CPR training class and the idea they are beating into our brains is that early advanced care is the key to saving lives. Forcing people to travel out of their way to find an operating emergency room completely contradict everything I have been taught. Also, as the hospital's director, I would not even consider offering care only to those who could afford services. Not only is that unfair but it is unethical. Most people cannot control their lack of financial stability and in life threatening situations there is not time to travel to find a hospital willing to work with them. Refusing service to people less fortunate is definitely not a way to earn more money for the hospital. I would get involved with as many fund raisers as possible to finance the hospital. There are always people willing to give to important causes, it would be my job to get the word out. I would probably ask for other opinions on how to manage my resources as well because my current community and I do not share the same morals. The thought of closing the emergency room of my hospital is absurd and not worth the time it would take to consider it. There is always an alternative for doing something as drastic as downsizing important facilities and services. My job as hospital director would be to brainstorm and come up with as many ways as possible to raise funds and keep my hospital open. ALL of my hospital open.

M.T.
Wylie High School
10/27/03

Well knowing what little I do about accounting from my father, I must say that a loss of $2 million
a year is a pretty big loss, but those 5000 patients that cannot pay for medicare is a pretty big number as well. I always believed that hospitals were made for helping people. Does that mean helping only those that can pay? In this case though, the hospital seems to only have two choices: to cut the emergency wing of the hospital, or to continue to lose massive amounts of money. As I've read all the other student responses, so far they've all been in favor of keeping the Emergency Room wing and fund-raising to help provide for the loss. And in a way I agree that shutting down a hospital wing would lead to a problem, but at the same time I would rather lose one or two departments of a hospital then an entire hospital. I mean, if the purpose of a hospital is to help people, how are they supposed to do that when they are closed? I'm not saying I would actually close the Emergency Room, but I would definitely consider all the facts closely. I'd take a close look at every department, at every bill, at every little detail to make a decision. I would not hastily make a decision for either side. In a matter of a business, you can't just go with what is "right" and "wrong". In a business, there are all kinds of important facts that help make decisions. I think Bill Gates would agree that major decisions, when it comes to a business or in life, should be made carefully. I would especially say that he would agree not to rush an answer along. It may take the hospital director a month or two when it comes to making the best decision. Of course, if possible, I would suggest making cuts in certain areas of certain departments, fund-raising efforts, and even just making a few budget cuts before drastically closing a department in a hospital. Who knows the amount of lives a closure like that could cost.

MR
James Martin Highschool
10/27/03

The number one priority in a hospital is to help people not to make money. And if you where to choose a department to shut down one of the last departments you would shut down is the emergency room. People who go to the emergency room do not go for their pleasure they go because they need emergency help that is why its called and emergency room. Also how can you ever even think of not offering services for people who cannot afford them? If you were that desperate for money you should instead do fundraisers and ask for help from the community. You could also try to get the people who owe you money to pay you by working with them so you can establish an affordable payment plan.

A.R.
10/25/03

While the ER may be the department that loses the most money, it is the department that is most needed. There is no debate at all about whether this department should be closed. Closing the Emergency Room threatens the community that the hospital takes care of. Awhile ago, the only ER in Las Vegas was threatening to close because of money problems. This would endanger the millions of people that live in Las Vegas and visit the city. Doctors have a responsibility to take care of any and all sick persons, and hospitals should have a responsibility to keep these resources open; instead, as the hospital director, I would raise funds by other means and close specialized departments that other hospitals could easily cover. If any hospital could not keep its ER open, then morally and logically, it would be the same as having no hospital at all.

W.W.
JJ Pearce High School
10/23/03

I would have to say that a hospital is a place were people go to get medical attention and help so
there is no possible way of shutting down any of the departments just because there not making enough money. Doctors are one of the main important jobs in the world without them everyone would be sick or hurt or even without medications to help them get better. So what I have to say is that no matter what the problem is you can find ways of making money by fund-raising, and cut back on the expensive prices of surgeries because I personally know they because my mom was diagnosed with cancer and we are going through a lot of things. Also how are the people who don’t have the money going to pay for it. Another way is cutting back on electricity because the machines that are plugged up and not being used unplug them, its not that hard. So taking a risk of shutting down any of the departments you could risk even losing more money than before. Do you want to take that risk? No I didn’t think so. People this is the 21st century we have all this technology to discover and plan new things don’t ya’ll realize that? You should by now. So continuing on this is not the end of your hospital.

A.A.
Mineral Wells High School
10/23/03

As a Texas hospital director I would definitely try to keep my hospital running. I would not eliminate hospital departments just because they aren’t making enough money. The emergency room is an important department and when an emergency arises I wouldn't like to tell people they have to go somewhere else. I also wouldn't want to tell someone that just had a car accident that the hospital can't help them because they don’t have the money or the insurance to pay for the bill. I would try everything in my power to keep the hospital from going out of business without eliminating important departments or not helping people who can't pay.

R.P.
Mineral Wells High School
10/23/03

Hospitals were made to help people not make money. If I were the hospital director the emergency room would be one of my main priorities. How would I tell my staff that there would be some departments being shut down, so you are going to have to find a new job? Let alone tell someone “I am sorry, but you are going to have to find another hospital because our ER is not in service.” Doing that would eat at my conscious, because I would no that doing so is wrong. Being director I would find some way to keep all of my staff here and all departments still running. I would try to earn money by having fundraisers, charity events, and if I have to cut down on staff salary. Besides what matters more money or helping people. I would try to earn money by having fundraisers, charity events, and if I have to cut down on staff salary. Besides what matters more money or helping people. So I would just have to tell the advisory committee that they were out of there mind, and they would have to find some other way to help us.

K.T.
Mineral Wells High School
10/23/03

Being the director of such an important facility, I would first try to scale down my ER, maybe by turning down patients that are not in need of real emergency care, such as a people who may just have the flu or something not as serious of that nature. I have been to many ER's in my life, and most of the people I have seen in them are just sick, or they have sick kids, who do not need emergency treatment, but they are just scared, so they go to the Emergency Room. I would refer
them to a local doctor who can give them the medical attention they need. I believe this would help cut down on patients who can not pay for medical care. I would also try to find another source of funding for our facilities, so that maybe we can continue to keep our hospital open. I would try to do everything within my power to keep parts or the whole of my hospital from shutting down.

J.D.
Mineral Wells High School
10/23/03

If I were a Texas hospital director and a review committee told me that I should close down something in my hospital, I would think that they were out of their minds. How could you practice without any patients. Or how could I close down something that so many people rely on everyday. I know that if I needed emergency care and I went to the hospital and they told me that I had to leave or go to a different hospital because they didn't have an ER anymore, I would be furious. I would try my hardest to do everything I could to keep from having to close anything down. I would try anything, fundraisers, even donations from my own pocket. You should be able to rely on all hospitals to tend to all your needs.

J.P.
Mineral Wells High School
10/23/03

Being the hospital director, I would not close a department in the hospital. Especially where a lot of patient are helped everyday. It would make the people suffer and not to mention all the doctors working in that certain area would end up losing there jobs. This would not be good for them or there families. As the patient tries to find help, I don't think they would like the fact that they would have to go to a hospital somewhere other then that hospital. If the next closest one to where they live was farther away by the time they got there the condition could be even worse.

If the problem is the money, all they would have to do is start a fundraiser to earn money. If they still don't have enough money they could take it to the people in that town. I am sure that the hospital could figure out someway to work with the people raise money to help the hospital.

If you just thought about it for a while I am sure that they could go by this problem in ways other then to close down a department of the hospital that is needed for help.

T.C.
Mineral Wells High School
10/23/03

If I were a hospital director, and had to call a meeting to look at my current hospital expenditures, because my hospital would go under otherwise, I would never start closing departments of my hospital. Especially the emergency room. The emergency room could make a difference between life and death for someone, how could someone be so inhumane to think that we would just close departments and fire good doctors and nurses. Then turn around and refuse to give help to people who need it only because, " We shut that department down." I would be past mortified to have to say that to someone.

Instead of shutting departments down, I would resort to fundraisers, writing letters to different organizations, companies, and to the federal government trying to get people to sponsor the hospital so much each year so it could continue to serve the community the way it always had in
Obviously the emergency room is vital because it serves more 5,000 patients a year. I would merge jobs together so that one person could take care of more jobs, and rid of unnecessary equipment and workers. Because what are people who are about to bleed to death, or about to die, or pass because of the pain going to do? These are emergencies that cannot wait for a room, or in line, or for it to subside some. They need immediate care. The emergency room is necessary, and it wouldn’t be a complete hospital without one. Without the emergency room, who is going to help the people who don’t quite have enough money? Are you just going to let them die? Make them wait in line? I couldn’t live with myself if I did that, and I bet you couldn’t either.

In response to the dilemma, as hospital director, I would not be able to close down any department in the hospital. Hospitals are there to help people, not to make money. You cannot turn people away who are in desperate need of medical attention and or treatment. I would write the Texas Governor, and request that the bill be reviewed and revised to meet the needs of hospitals and people of the community and the state. Closing down the Emergency Room would only create more problems. There are always special funds, grants, and offers to people of every race and religion, even some based on your marital status, current employment, and number of children living in the household. There are many charities designed to help people pay for medical treatment. Providing people with information on these charities and organizations, and helping them get in touch with them would solve many financial problems. If it came down to it, I would have to ask for donations from people in the community to help keep these hospitals up and running.

If I was in this situation I would be looking for ways to keep everything open. This might include asking for more volunteers or having fund raisers. A hospital is for everybody, not just a money making facility. I would hate to have a hospital without an Emergency Room. Now, if possible I would like to put in a "Fast Track" Emergency Room in addition to the existing one, even if all it is a partition between sign in areas. This would be for the not so urgent "emergencies." Though, if my hospital had a Neonatel facility that was only used once every blue moon, then I could see, with great regret losing that facility. I would do everything in my power to keep everything we already had.

My priorities as a director are my patients because if there are no patients there is no practice. Without a practice there is no need for a hospital, and we know that isn't true. 87% of those in need
of medical attention are the ones who cannot afford their treatment. Why, then, would we want to take away their only method for medicinal help? There would be profitable aspects of closing the ER, I'm not saying there wouldn't. What I am saying is that the effects of the closure would be morally, in the community as well as within the employees of the hospital. Morale is a necessity of all businesses, whether it is a small town bakery or a brokerage firm on Wallstreet. I don't understand how our state, country, the world has been perverted so much as to want to place monetary matters above human life. "Ethics" you say, the meaning of this term gives you the answer to your problem. It is proper ethics that keeps us humane, and analytical while still having feelings. I want the ER to remain open because it is the primary care site for thousands of patients who cannot pay for regular medical care. It is those people who must get the medication and therapy they require. The wealthy can't be the only ones who receive medical attention, their money does not put them higher on the list of priorities. We say, "All men are created equal," but what isn't heard: "Some more equally than others." is very harmful to the average income family. A hospital is built to provide treatment and care for a given community. Given this community, shutting down the ER is not an option. I admit, there may be some places where the community is not so demanding of its medical aid, and there it might be appropriate to consider closing down the Emergency Room department. But where I come from, where the practice lies, is not a place to allow such an act. The circumstances are extenuating for closure of one or more departments, but we must have all branches for an emergency situation, should one arise (need I remind you that's what a hospital is for). Whatever is in my power, I will do to keep all departments operating. I will initiate traditional fundraisers, as well as paying out of my own pocket if it helps to maintain a fully functional hospital. Ethics, that is a trait we should all acquire, for our state, country, world could only benefit.

D.T.
Mineral Wells High School
10/22/03

I think that if I was the hospital director I would begin a fundraiser so that I wouldn't have to face the choice of closing down one of my departments that would help many people. maybe I could get some famous actors and actresses or other famous people to help support my fundraiser. I think that the worst thing I could do is tell someone who is in need of help to go to a different hospital.

CC
10/7/03

Being the hospital director, I would first and foremost try and make some money for the hospital - whether it be a fundraiser, an auction, or a gala with famous people (sports stars, movie stars, singers, etc...). If a committee told me that I should close some of the departments in my hospital, I would tell them they were out of their minds, we can't put doctors out of work, and we definitely cannot tell patients they must go to another town and/or hospital just because we "no longer offer that procedure" or "we don't have an ER anymore". That is morally wrong and I would be ashamed if I had to tell someone that. I would do everything in my power to keep all of the departments open, even if I had to make large donations to the hospital.

A.M.
Health Careers High School