

Interactive Ethics

The Ethics Program and STARS invites comments on the ethics dilemma that follows. Students should send their comments by e-mail to ethics@utsouthwestern.edu. We will post your comments with your initials, school name, and class subject (or anonymously if you prefer). At the end of the comment period, we also will post a perspective from the ethics program.

CASE FOR MARCH-MAY 2010

(closed for comments)

Kidney Transplantation

Transplanting kidneys into people with kidney failure saves lives and increases the length and quality of the patient's life. In the USA in 2007, 70,870 people needing a kidney for transplantation were on a waiting list because a suitable kidney for transplantation was not available. Currently, kidneys can be donated by living volunteers, and by families who agree to donate kidneys from a recently-deceased family member. However, donating a kidney for money (selling a kidney) is illegal in the US. However, some people have advocated that the number of available organs for transplantation could increase dramatically if we legalized a "regulated" market in kidney sales. A "regulated market" for kidney sales means that certain laws would be put in place that would prevent potential dangers and taking advantage of people who might sell a kidney because they need money.

Questions:

1. What are the ethical risks posed by paying for kidney s from a living person?
2. What protections (regulations) would be required if we legalized the selling of kidneys?
3. Do you think any protections would be adequate to protect people from exploitation? If not, why?

Dear Students,

Thank you for your thoughtful and interesting comments. We received responses from over 100 students. Here's the professional response from a UT Southwestern faculty member. We hope you have enjoyed participating in this process.

Professional Response

[Fabrice Jotterand, PhD, MA](#)

Assistant Professor of Clinical Sciences & Psychiatry (Bioethics/Philosophy)
Division of Ethics and Health Policy, Department of Clinical Sciences
Division of Ethics, Department of Psychiatry
UT Southwestern Medical Center at Dallas

Two levels of analysis characterize my reply to this case. First, we need to address the question concerning the exact role of a regulated market. One could argue that a legitimate market would slowly dismantle the existing black market and avoid the trafficking of organs as practiced in countries like India. It would provide an open arena for the selling of organs under adequate medical supervision. There also is a purely pragmatic reason to establish a regulated market. Statistics show that the number of living donors decreased from 2004 (7,004) to 2006 (6,732) while the prevalence of chronic renal failure has increased. In 2006 alone, 3,916 kidney patients died while waiting for transplantation despite strong evidence that kidney donation does not affect survival or increase the risk of end-stage renal disease. An open market could in principle increase the number of donations, save lives and provide an extra income to people in need. To circumvent exploitation and coercion, such market would not need to be based on supply and demand. We could imagine a system of financial compensation that applies uniformly to every case, independent of one's financial situation. The transaction would take place between the donor and an agency responsible to manage the selling and buying of kidneys.

The second issue is a more fundamental question that concerns the nature of organs and whether they meet the definition of commodities. That is, are kidneys identical to goods such as tires, apples or steaks that can be exchanged purely for money? An unregulated market, based on economic principles, could convey a distorted meaning of ownership and a sense of entitlement that undermines the nature of the donation. Let me illustrate my point with the following example. Let's imagine Mr. Jones is a rich businessman in need of a kidney. He puts an ad in the newspaper and offer \$ 250,000 to purchase a kidney from a healthy person. He is your friend and you agree to sell one of your kidneys. Post-surgery you discover that Mr. Jones' lifestyle endangers the health of his kidneys (drug use, alcohol abuse, etc.). How would you feel about it? Is Mr. Jones entitled to behave as such? After all he bought the kidney; it is his and he can "use" it as he wishes! Or does he have a moral obligation to take care of his health/kidneys due to the nature of the good? Does the financial transaction entitle him to "use" the kidney as he wishes? This is a hypothetical case and it is unlikely that an individual would behave in this manner. But this example illustrates the difference between mere goods and the donation of a kidney for money. A regulated market might constitute a viable option to increase the number of kidney donations. The challenge will be to create a system that protects vulnerable potential donors and conveys the donation not purely in economic terms. After all we are still talking about a donation!

Student Responses:

6-05-10

1. If selling kidneys becomes legal there would be some risks. One of those risks could be that someone is forced to sell their kidney against their will, and have someone else receive the money. One question to ask is, if a person died and a family has permission to sell the organs then would the family receive the money? If so that would mean that people could kill someone claim it was a family member and take the money. It is also possible that people who don't want to part with one of their kidneys would be swayed to do so by friends or family that needs the money.

2. If selling organs was legalized then there would have to be many strict regulations. Some of those regulations could be the persons willing consent, many documents showing who this person is (birth certificate, passport, license, etc. ...). This person would also have to have tests done to see if they are healthy and have no unknown diseases. This person must be able to live a normal, healthy, life with just one kidney.

3. Honestly, I don't think that these protections would completely protect a person from exploitation. This is because somehow or another people always seem to find ways around laws and regulations.

J.L.V.G. - Pearce High School

6-01-10

1. The ethical way would be, is to give your kidney to someone in need for no money. Since families are in desperate need to save their loved ones they are giving back money like if you're selling something so more people will donate their kidney. But with everything that happens in life there are risks. For example there are going to be peopling out there that need there kidney, but give it up do they can have money in their wallets. It may seem like you're doing a good deed, but deep down there in it for the money. That can be understandable considering the economy lately, but it's not right.

2. There has to be regulations for protecting your body and the person you're giving the kidney to. Some regulations might be to make sure your body can afford to lose a kidney. Can your body afford to lose a kidney? Some people may have serious side effects from losing a kidney, that would hurt there body. Therefore every participant should be checked by their doctor and to prove it with a doctor note. And there should most definitely be a set price for the kidney.

3. There isn't any restriction or regulation that can be placed to prevent exploitation. That's like the law about drinking under the age of 21 and people everywhere do it and also like saying it's illegal to steal and people do that as well. So with that said there will be people that just do it for the money and will avoid the rules to get to the money. I do believe that the doctors who are doing this procedure try their best keep the rules in place but there is always someone somewhere who will break them.

N.M.C.- J. J. Pierce High School

5-31-10

1. I think it is ethical because it is a win win situation. The people that are in need of money sell a kidney, and the people in need of a kidney that probably aren't going to get one, buy a kidney. When you are desperate for something and can't get it you feel hopeless, when you have a chance of buying one, you can always have hope of getting the money.

2. The protections that should be required are if the kidneys and 100% healthy, and that should be it. It's people's own business if they want to be a part of the selling/buying of kidneys.

3. Protections should be used, because if a person were to put their lives at risk for just money,

regulations should have the approval of the person donating and approval of the one who receives it.

E.G.- J. J. Pearce High School

5-31-10

1. I think it is ethical because it is a win-win situation. The people that are in need of money sell a kidney, and the people in need of a kidney that probably aren't going to get one, buy a kidney. When you are desperate for something and can't get it you feel hopeless, when you have a chance of buying one, you can always have hope of getting the money.

2. The protections that should be required are if the kidneys are 100% healthy, and that should be it. It's people's own business if they want to be a part of the selling/buying of kidneys.

3. Protections should be used, because if a person were to put their lives at risk for just money, regulations should have the approval of the person donating and approval of the one who receives it.

E.G. - J. J. Pearce High School

5-27-10

1. I think it is unethical because the people who may need the organs the most may not be able to buy them. Or there could be people who buy them and then save them for their own good. I think it is unethical but if it is to help save more lives, then that would be the way to go. The main goal in mind is to help save lives.

2. There would have to be laws about who can buy and sell organs. We would have to make sure all the organs are a match and that people aren't there for any reason besides saving somebody's life.

3. I think there are protections that can be made to help exploitation, but there is always someone who will be able to beat the system.

T.E. – J. J. Pearce High School

5-23-10

1. One reason there would be ethical risks involved in for paying for kidneys from a living person is that people on both sides of the trade would be taken advantage of. On the donating side, poorer families who wouldn't normally want to donate a kidney may be financially forced to because of needing money. On the other side of the trade, people who are in need of a kidney are in a vulnerable position because it is life or death for them and they have no control over the rates that their kidneys are sold at.

2. If selling of kidneys was legalized there would definitely need to be a system of going into a hospital and having the procedure taken care of. No businesses that do the removing and/or the selling. The government would have to keep control of the whole process and make it illegal for anyone outside of the hospital to get in on the business, thus avoiding problems with skyrocketing prices just for one person's monetary gain.

3. I think it would be almost impossible for adequate protections to be found because if the opportunity even exists to those in a bad place financially to sell their kidney, they will do it to help pay off other things, even if they don't understand what they're doing by donating an organ.

R. S. - J. .J. Pearce High School

5.21.10

1. One risk is that certain people might try to earn a profit by taking advantage of the system. People might attempt to buy kidneys and then re-sell them at higher prices. There would be fewer donors because not many people will be willing to give away a kidney when they can earn money for it. And once "free" kidneys are no longer available, people will be able to demand whatever price they want for their kidney. People in need may be forced to pay ridiculous prices. Also, people in need of financial help may be pressured into selling kidneys by their family, particularly children.

2. There would have to be laws regulating who can donate and how the donors should be paid. For example, there should be laws to prevent minors from selling organs in order protect children. And donors should be required to undergo examinations to make sure that they are in good enough condition to donate a healthy organ. And the government must find some way to regulate price agreements to prevent people from taking advantage of those in need of organs.

3. No matter how many regulations are created to manage the buying and selling of kidneys, there will always be some amount of exploitation, particularly for a system such as trading organs. People searching for kidneys would be desperate and willing to do whatever it takes to obtain them, so it would be more difficult to enforce laws and prevent illegal trade.

S. B. - J. J. Pearce High School

5-21-10

1. Ethical risks posed by paying for kidneys vary, but could be a big deal. One risk that would be taken in legalizing the sales of kidneys (and other organs) could lead to a black market and crimes like theft being committed. People might sacrifice their future health or well being due to financial

standings, or be pressured into doing it by friends or family for the money. Also, some may be greedy in the amount of money for their organs.

2. The sales of kidneys would have to be legitimate and go through an organization or government system, not just through ordinary people. There would have to be waivers signed because obviously once it is in somebody else, it's staying there. This will avoid a lot of people that change their minds later on and are looking to sue the person who obtained their organ. The kidneys' that are going to be transplanted should be a positive match, so as not to go to waste or cause any harm.

3. Yes, regulations would be necessary to prevent exploitation.

A. M. W.- J. J. Pearce High School

5-21-10

1. An ethical risk in selling kidneys from living people would be that some kidney donors would only sell their kidney to the highest bidder. Potentially bypassing the most needy of patients. Basically only the wealthy would be able to afford a kidney. Less fortunate people would die. I also think that God wants us to help others out of the goodness of our hearts, not to put a few extra bucks in our pockets.

2. If kidney selling were legalized, I think one protection could be that a cap be placed on the cost. Therefore all kidney donors sell their kidneys for the same price and then the kidney would be sold to the next patient on the current kidney transplant list.

3. If selling kidneys was legalized, I do not think any protection would be adequate. Regardless of how many protections are put in place, you will always have people trying to make money and trying to get around the system. Donors should DONATE, not sell.

B. B. -J. J. Pearce High School

5-21-10

1. The risks could be the condition of the kidney could not be up to certain standards. There could also be the problem of the people who need the kidney but can't afford it.

2. I believe if we did legalize the selling of kidney's there would need to be certain laws to keep it in check. The person who is selling the kidney should have to get a doctors approval to ensure the kidney is in good condition. They should also need to make sure that the price for the kidney isn't an exuberant amount so people in economic trouble come "running" to sell their kidney.

3. There would be adequate protections but they can't stop exploitation from happening by that goes for

just about everything so I don't think it would be a major problem.

S. C. – J. J. Pearce High School

5-21-10

1. Ethical risks include the fact that the person selling the organ would be able to take advantage of the person in need. Considering the fact that it is not possible to live without at least one kidney, the person selling would be able to take as much money as they wanted.

2. Somehow there would have to be regulations on the selling of organs because of the fact that if everyone goes trading organs there would not be any way to keep tabs on what is where, or in whom. It would also be possible to put a tax on this and the government could make more money.

3. No, because it would be impossible for people to keep track and keep all people safe. There would still be a black market for kidneys and other organs; there is just nothing we can do about that.

A .K. W. – J. J. Pearce High School

5-20-10

1. Some ethical risks of selling kidneys could be violence. This could occur if say the market got into to high of a demand and if people who were in dire need of a kidney transplant threatened the life of a person unwilling to sell his or her kidney. Another ethical risk is that the meaning of this whole process will be changed because there will be some people who only do this for the money and not for the sole reason of saving another human being's life.

2. If we do legalize the selling of kidneys there would need to be an investigation of both parties in the situation. It needs to be certain that the donor is in perfect health and that his or her kidney will not harm the receiving person. How the transaction came about also needs to be investigated to ensure that no violence or any other harmful behavior came about.

3. I think that there will always be protections to protect from most exploitation but I also think that there will always be those few people who are able to find the loopholes and go behind the protectors' backs.

O.R.

5-20-10

1. Some risks of selling kidneys could be that something could be wrong with the kidney! The person receiving the kidney could have something wrong that doesn't go well with the sold kidney.

2. I think that a series of tests should be run on the kidney to be sure that there is nothing wrong with the organs. There could be a disease or something harmful that nobody wants to get!

3. If the organ selling was properly regulated. It was also have to be watched very closely but people could be protected.

S.B. -J. J. Pearce High School

5-20-10

1. Some risks that are posed are the amount of money. The economy we have is difficult to earn money. So having a "regulated" market would be necessary and it should be strictly in forced.

2. Some regulations if legalized would be to appoint certain people to sell and buy the kidneys. An example would be certain doctors and agencies that work for the government in health. If not just random people would be selling and buying kidneys and it will be chaos.

3. If the right protection and regulations are taken, then there wouldn't be any exploitation.

M.P. - J. J. Pearce High School

5-20-10

1. There is two ethical risks that concern me with the practice of selling kidneys. One ethical risk would be the forcing of family members to sell their kidney to help pay for family expenses. Another ethical risk would be that the financial gain would motivate people with communicable diseases to sell their kidneys.

2. There are several regulations that would need to be enforced before allowing kidneys to be sold. One regulation would be that the kidneys and donors need to be tested for any communicable diseases. There would need to be strict criteria for what would be allowed and what wouldn't be allowed. Another is restricting the age limit to eighteen and above so that children would not be forced to sell their kidneys. Finally, there should be a set price for the kidneys so that people would not charge an exorbitant amount of money to desperate patients.

3. These protections would help safe guard against exploitation; however desperate or unethical people would still find loopholes. Though there are risks associated with the selling of kidneys, I still support legalizing it so we can increase the amount of available kidneys.

E.J.W. - J. J. Pearce High School

5-20-10

1. An ethical risk would be that even you're getting a kidney some people might have a certain disease or condition that you're not aware of. In that case it only makes the situation worse which the purpose of all this is to make you have a long living healthy life. But a positive way to look at it is that it's a win win scenario. The donor gets money and the other person ends with a kidney instead of being left without anything.

2. We need to make sure donors with a clean health history are the ones that are authorized to sell their kidney. Make sure everything is okay with the person because the whole point of donating a kidney is so the other person can be worry free and not end up worrying about a certain disease they weren't informed about. So yes, definitely check there health status and all.

3. Of course, I know not all the people selling kidneys are in for the money but we should find a way to stop exploitation or at least prevent it from happening.

A. H.-J. J. Pearce High School

5-20-10

1. The ethical risks that selling kidneys pose are that people that really need a kidney that don't have a lot of money can be deprived of that opportunity which actually used to be free. Also the person that is donating the organ might have an infectious disease and they could be just looking to get some money. Then there's also the fact that you are putting a price on something that is worth more than any amount of money. It's pretty much like selling a part of yourself which is wrong because God created all of us as unique and special people that are worth more than any amount of money someone can give you. If you are donating it to someone that is a huge act of kindness but when you sell a kidney you are looking for something in return.

2. First of all they should do some sort of testing for diseases to make sure it is good to use. Then the government should also regulate the pricing to make sure it is fair for all people. These protections should definitely be used if the United States should ever allow the selling of kidneys.

3. No, it won't be adequate to stop people from exploitation. There are rules that have been placed on society ever since the beginning of time and humanity has always found ways to break them so what's going to be different this time around.

B. K.- J. J. Pearce High School

5-20-10

The ethical risks posed by an open market for organ trade would be like the many other students before me the extortion of people who desperately need money and even if laws were put in place to prevent this from happening would it really stop it completely. So the real ethics problem here is are you willing for the people who have the money to buy them from people who are only doing it for the money? But if there were to be any laws there would have to tremendous disease control of course and there would most likely be lots of taxes imposed. There would probably be several "organ services" if you will and these would be heavily regulated. But if I was in charge you could sell whatever YOU wanted to sell.

J. A. - J. J. Pearce High School

5-20-10

1. There are many ethical risks posed by the legalization of selling kidneys for money. If a person that needed a kidney, but didn't have the money then they would be left to die. Another problem is that the organs could quickly become overpriced. Only the rich could be getting the kidneys. People could also start scamming people with bad kidneys. They could sell bad kidneys or kidneys that don't function well.

2. If it was legalized, there would have to be regulations on a price. There would have to be a way to make sure kidneys were not stolen from people unwilling to give them up. They would have to be checked to make sure they were working. There would be a lot of scams if it was legalized. They would also have to make sure the kidneys are not being sold for a ridiculously unreasonable amount of money.

3. No matter how many protections there are, people would find a way around them and sell them for a lot of money. If there was say a price limitation, people would just secretly deal the kidneys.

M. R.

5-20-10

1. One ethical risk posed by paying for kidneys from a living person is that the person selling their kidney

may just be selling it for the money. Also the person selling the organ could run the price up as high as they could before finally selling it to the person in need.

2. Some regulations that would be put in place would be checking to make sure that the kidney is a reliable kidney in good health and that a professional is doing the surgery.

3. Even if there was protection people would still find a way to sell their kidney and get away with it. As long as there is a policy some people will always disobey it, if possible.

B. F.- J. J. Pearce High School

5-20-10

1. An ethical risk of selling kidneys would be the safety of the procedure. Not all the time people wake up from the procedure of removing a kidney and sometimes they die shortly after word in pain. Also not all people can live with only one kidney. With all the people in America eating fast food, as much as 7 times a week, their kidney stones are becoming very unhealthy. Going further on that note, when transferring a kidney to a patient in need of a kidney there could be unhealthy kidneys transferred causing the person to possibly die.

2. The kidneys should only be transferred professionally by a specialized doctor. The person that is selling their kidney should only have their kidneys taken out at a hospital or surgical room and should have to sign lots of papers. They also should have a full physical exam with lots of tests to make sure that they are healthy enough to have only one kidney for the rest of their life and/or to make sure their kidney is healthy enough for someone else. There should be a set standard for a healthy kidney. You should also have to be 18 and a legal citizen of the U.S. That way there wouldn't be people coming up from Mexico or down from Canada trying to sell their kidneys.

3. Well most of the American people would abide by the rules but there are always the black-market sellers and doctors. Although this is dangerous, many people that did not have enough money for the procedure or needed the money quickly would go and use the opportunity. There are times that (bad) parents will take their kid to the black-market to sell their kidneys even if the child wasn't healthy enough or didn't want to do it.

L. M. G. – J. J. Pearce High School

5-20-10

1. The ethical risks posed by paying for kidneys are that if you don't have enough money to buy a kidney,

then you are either going to die, or you are going to have to search very very hard, and still die. It's ethically wrong to make someone pay tons of money to stay alive.

2. The amount of regulations that the government would have to put on this subject would be unlimited. They would have to make sure that people aren't killed for their kidneys, and they would have to make sure that nothing happens to donated kidneys.

3. I believe that if there was a way to protect people from exploitation, it would be to have doctors refuse to do surgery on people who are being exploited.

B. J. H. B - J. J. Pearce High School

5-20-10

1. Ethical risks that are posed when paying for kidneys is diseases that may be contracted when a patient receives a kidney. People with addictions (drugs, alcohol, etc.) or other illnesses who sell their kidney could possibly infect the patient. For example, alcohol causes kidney damage, and if an alcoholic sells their kidney, their kidney will have severe damage, not helping the patient in any way.

2. Regulations that must be imposed are a medical history check, showing that if they have a disease that can damage the kidney, then it would be best not to sell it. Not only the seller's medical history should be required, but also, the seller's family medical history because many things are hereditary. The price of selling and buying kidneys should be regulated. Sellers would take advantage of the patients who desperately need a kidney--who are willing to pay anything.

3. The best way to prevent exploitation is having confidentiality between the two clients. The two clients should not know each other. Like always, people find a way to get around the situation to benefit.

C. F. – J. J. Pearce High School

5-20-10

1. Some ethical risks in paying for kidneys from a living person are that there is no assurance that the organs will be bought for good intentions. Kidneys could be bought just to be sold for more expensive. On a waiting list for a kidney, there are some very wealthy and some not wealthy patients, it is not biased, but if selling kidneys was legalized, all of a sudden wealthy patients at the bottom of the list are able to afford the kidneys that a person at the top of the list might not be able to. Hope for poorer families would be little to none.

2. In order for the selling of kidneys to work ethically, a person would not be able to charge an unreasonable amount for the organ. Also, the organs would have to be bought specifically by hospitals, so that there would be no selling of them again for more expensive.

3. There are laws against selling drugs, but people still find ways to do that, I think that even if there were regulations to avoid exploitation, there would be people that could figure a way around them.

V. G. L. – J. J. Pearce High School

5-20-10

1. It could be unethical to pay for a kidney because you should not put a price on bodies. Once kidneys became valued in money other organs would be too. It can also hinder a person in need of a kidney or any other organ if they could not afford the price of the organ.

2. A regulation that would need to be set would be putting price limits on the kidney. It would not be fair to sell kidneys that are really needed at an unreasonable price. A person should donate a kidney because they care not to just make money.

3. I think many protections could be made but they would for sure be argued and controversial. There could be a lot of pressure put on a person that is ready or willing to give up a kidney.

L.E. –J. J. Pearce High School

5-20-10

1. Some ethical risks would be everybody trying to sell their kidneys for the money. You would have all sorts of people just selling their kidneys for the money because they are needy of the money. People would just go sell kidneys just to get money and that isn't a very good way to earn money. People might not be able to buy the kidneys too.

2. You have to be healthy to sell your kidneys. If it is legalized you have to protect people from having their kidney stolen. Health has to also be certified by a doctor. Verify that they are medically fit enough to have surgery on.

3. Yes, because otherwise you would have people going around stealing other people's kidneys. They

also need to only accept kidneys from kidney donation centers because if you didn't you would have people just show up with a stolen kidney.

J. R.W. - J. J. Pearce High School

5-20-10

1. Ethical risks of paying for a kidney from a living person would be people forcing someone to sell their kidney or people who need a kidney, but cannot afford to pay for one from a donor, would be deprived of the opportunity to live.

2. Some protections that would need to be required if we legalized the selling of kidneys would be that the donor would need to be tested for diseases and anything that could affect the recipient of the kidney. The government would also need to regulate the prices that people could charge for their kidneys so that everyone could get a fair chance at receiving a kidney.

3. There would definitely need to be protections put in place to protect people from being exploited because people desperate for money or kidneys may try and harm someone for their kidney or overprice kidneys.

P. K.P. – J. J. Pearce High School

5-19-10

1. I believe that it is ethical to legalize the selling of kidneys because it would save many people's lives. I think that because legalizing the sale of organs would save so many lives, it should be considered ethical because there are very few possible negative consequences compared to the many benefits. I think that one possible ethical risk is that people would try to get the most money they can for a kidney, and charge a price that's much too high for their kidney. It'd be really easy for people to do that because in many cases there may only be one match, so the person in need of a transplant has to either pay that high price or die.

2. I think that it would be important to regulate a price for the kidneys, or set a standard price that everyone has to sell their kidneys for. If not, the prices would be driven up, and many of the people who need kidneys wouldn't be able to get them because they couldn't afford them. There would also have to be strict regulations that ensured that all the kidneys being sold are healthy and safe.

3. I do think that these protections would be adequate to protect people, for the most part, from

exploitation. There's no 100% fool proof way to protect from exploitation in anything, but I think that strict regulations on health and price of kidneys being sold would prevent most exploitation. The removal and transplant have to be done through a hospital so it would be easy to regulate.

K. F. – J. J. Pearce High School

5-19-10

1. Ethical risks for selling kidneys could be people selling fake or damaged kidneys to make money. People might also put themselves in harm's way by doing the kidney transplant surgery and trying to do more to their body than should be done. This is also tearing your body apart and could be considered unethical by people and even their different religions.

2. If selling kidneys would be legal I think there should be a set price that people could buy them for so that people do not get ripped off or try and rip people off. I also think that the person selling the kidney should be checked for a lot of diseases to prevent the spread of diseases through a preventable cause. The legalization of kidney selling could work but might have to be tested before made completely legal in the United States.

3. Yes, I think there would need to be many laws in place to prevent exploitation, or people from selfish utilization. Some of these laws could be to keep a record of people that are donors so there's no possible way they can slip by getting another operation to make money. There would also have to be some type of law to prevent people from being blackmailed or forced into selling a kidney to make money or to make money for someone else.

A.J.H. - J. J. Pearce High School

5-18-10

1. Some ethical risks of selling kidneys could be the opening of an organ trade company or the extortion of some who refuse to sell. For example if one would make a large sum of money from selling kidneys, then what would happen if one man decides to buy all the organs that are legal to buy and sell. Then he sells the organs to people who are in dire need for a ridiculous amount of money. Or what if families in need force their children or family to sell the organ for a large sum of money.

2. If we indeed legalized the selling of kidneys, then we would need certain laws that wouldn't allow people to cheat the system. An example would be the organ trade I was talking about in my first answer. They would need laws that would only allow trade from the donor to the family that would have to be approved by a branch of a government organization like the FDA.

3. Yes, I believe that if organ trade was regulated properly, and watched closely people could be protected from exploitation.

J. M. C.- J. J. Pearce High School

5-18-10

1. Maybe if it legalizes people would probably just do this to get money out of it. Instead of intending to try to save somebody's life. Or even maybe the person may not be in the best health, the donor could have health issues so that could be a risk.

2. If selling kidneys does become legal, doctors should at least examine the person who is going to give the kidney for health issues. They should also check how much a person is giving for a kidney it could be a high price but it's what could save their life.

3. Even if there was some protection someone would find a way around to still selling a kidney. Or someone could say they are donating the kidney but they are actually selling it to the patient without anybody knowing.

J.V. - J. J. Pearce High School

5-17-10

1. There are many ethical risks posed by paying for kidneys from a living person. If a person does not have the money to pay for the kidney, then he/she would be deprived of the opportunity to get a kidney. Also, if the donor has health problems that are undiagnosed then the patient could become infected with a worse condition. Some may have kidneys removed against their will or without a thorough thought process. For example, if a person is in need of money immediately, he/she would be more inclined to sell the kidney without even thinking about health-related consequences down the road. Some can argue that a prospective donor should donate a kidney because it is the right thing to do, not because he/she is receiving monetary reimbursement. However others can argue that selling your plasma is legal and therefore this should be too.

2. If the selling of kidneys were legalized, there most definitely would have to be regulations enacted. For example the kidney and its donor should be thoroughly tested for any diseases, allergies, etc. - similar to regulations for donating blood. If any minor conditions existed the recipient must be aware of it and have the opportunity to refuse the transplant. The donor would have to be in good health standing and have doctors and/or governmental approval. Finally, the government must regulate pricing of the kidneys to ensure everyone pays a fair price and the market does not get out of control.

3. Kidney selling must be regulated to prevent exploitation, but no matter what there would still be

loopholes and authoritative figures not following correct policy. Also, someone in dire need of money or someone desperate to save a friend or family member would do whatever is necessary to do the transplant. There must be some strict regulations to avoid patients killing or severely harming one another in order to get a kidney.

J.F. - J. J. Pearce High School